## Flygtningenævnets baggrundsmateriale

Bilagsnr.:	319
Land:	Ukraine
Kilde:	UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)
Titel:	Compilation on the Russian Federation
Udgivet:	19. marts 2018
Optaget på baggrundsmaterialet:	16. maj 2018



Distr.: General 19 March 2018

Original: English

Human Rights Council Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Thirtieth session 7–18 May 2018

## **Compilation on the Russian Federation**

## Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

## I. Background

1. The present report was prepared pursuant to Human Rights Council resolutions 5/1 and 16/21, taking into consideration the periodicity of the universal periodic review. It is a compilation of information contained in reports of treaty bodies and special procedures and other relevant United Nations documents, presented in a summarized manner owing to word-limit constraints.

## II. Scope of international obligations and cooperation with international human rights mechanisms and bodies<sup>1,2</sup>

- 2. In 2017, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights encouraged the Russian Federation to consider ratifying the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.<sup>3</sup>
- 3. In 2017, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination called upon the Russian Federation to consider ratifying the International Labour Organization (ILO) Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169) and formally endorse the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.<sup>4</sup> The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights recommended that the Russian Federation consider ratifying the ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169).<sup>5</sup>
- 4. The Russian Federation was encouraged by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women<sup>6</sup> and urged by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination<sup>7</sup> to consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families and the International Convention for the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights<sup>8</sup> and the Committee on the Rights of the Child<sup>9</sup> recommended that it do so also.
- 5. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination<sup>10</sup> encouraged the Russian Federation to accede to the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness. The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)<sup>11</sup> recommended that it do so also.

GE.18-04191(E)







- 6. In 2014, the Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that the Russian Federation ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure, the Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, aiming at the abolition of the death penalty, the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.<sup>12</sup>
- 7. The same Committee also recommended that the Russian Federation use its permanent position in the Security Council in a more consistent and child rights-focused manner, in order to promote the implementation of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict in all States parties.<sup>13</sup>
- 8. In the period under review, the Russian Federation made financial contributions annually to the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR).<sup>14</sup>

## III. National human rights framework<sup>15</sup>

- 9. The Committee on the Rights of the Child noted the establishment of the post of commissioner for children's rights at the federal and regional levels. However, it was concerned about the non-transparent procedure for appointing commissioners. 16
- 10. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women recommended that the Russian Federation proceed, within a clear time frame and financial resources, with the establishment of a high-level commission on women's rights.<sup>17</sup>
- 11. UNHCR noted the establishment of the General Administration for Migration Issues under the Ministry of the Interior in April 2016.<sup>18</sup>

# IV. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

## A. Cross-cutting issues

## 1. Equality and non-discrimination<sup>19</sup>

- 12. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination regretted that comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation was still absent from the legal order and recommended that the Russian Federation bring the definition of discrimination in article 136 of its Criminal Code into line with the Convention. <sup>20</sup> The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women <sup>21</sup> raised similar concerns as did the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The latter was concerned about the prevalence of societal stigma and discrimination in particular on the grounds of disability, ethnicity, sexual orientation, gender identity or health status.<sup>22</sup>
- 13. United Nations experts urged the authorities to end the persecution of people perceived to be gay or bisexual who were living in a climate of fear fuelled by homophobic speeches in Chechnya, and to investigate abductions, unlawful detentions, torture, beatings and killings in that connection.<sup>23</sup>
- 14. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination expressed concern that racist hate speech was still used by officials and politicians and that some media outlets continued to disseminate negative stereotypes and prejudices against ethnic minority groups, including Roma.<sup>24</sup>

15. The same Committee welcomed the measures taken to prevent manifestations of racial discrimination in sport, including the implementation of a cooperation arrangement with OHCHR on combatting racial discrimination in sport and the development of a special handbook for the prevention of discrimination in sport.<sup>25</sup>

### 2. Development, the environment, and business and human rights<sup>26</sup>

- 16. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights regretted that the official development assistance of the Russian Federation (0.08 per cent of gross national product) fell far below the internationally agreed commitment of 0.7 per cent.<sup>27</sup>
- 17. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was concerned that extractive and development projects had caused irreparable damage on indigenous peoples' right to use and enjoy their traditionally owned lands and natural resources, and that the Russian Federation had frequently failed to respect the principle of free, prior and informed consent of indigenous peoples.<sup>28</sup> The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights raised similar concerns and recommended that the Russian Federation establish, without further delay, federally protected territories.<sup>29</sup>
- 18. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned about the negative impact on children's health of the extraction of coal and the production of asbestos.<sup>30</sup>
- 19. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights regretted that the Russian Federation had not adopted a national action plan on business and human rights.<sup>31</sup>
- 20. The Special Rapporteur on the negative impact of unilateral coercive measures on the enjoyment of human rights considered that a review of unilateral coercive measures targeting the Russian Federation was overdue. He recommended that the review be engaged upon without delay in a way that spared innocent civilians from unintended adverse human rights impacts.<sup>32</sup>

#### 3. Human rights and counter-terrorism<sup>33</sup>

- 21. The Human Rights Committee reiterated its recommendation <sup>34</sup> that the Russian Federation take all measures necessary to ensure that its counter-terrorism legislation and practices were in full compliance with its obligations under the Covenant, and also ensure that its counter-terrorism legislation provided for an independent mechanism to review counter-terrorism activities undertaken by the executive.<sup>35</sup>
- 22. The same Committee recommended that the Russian Federation ensure that all human rights violations committed during security and counter-terrorism operations in the North Caucasus federal area were thoroughly investigated, that perpetrators were prosecuted and sanctioned, and that victims or their families were provided with remedies, including access to justice and reparations.<sup>36</sup>
- 23. The Committee also recommended that the Russian Federation immediately end the practice of collective punishment of relatives and suspected supporters of alleged terrorists and provide remedies to victims for violations of their rights, including for damage of property and forced expulsion.<sup>37</sup>

## B. Civil and political rights

## 1. Right to life, liberty and security of person<sup>38</sup>

- 24. The Human Rights Committee remained concerned about reports that torture and ill-treatment, including for eliciting confessions, were still widely practised.<sup>39</sup>
- 25. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned about widespread ill-treatment and abuses by the police of children in police detention or during pretrial proceedings, especially Roma children.<sup>40</sup>
- 26. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination expressed concern that violent racist attacks, targeting particularly people from Central Asia and the Caucasus and persons belonging to ethnic minorities remained a pressing problem.<sup>41</sup> The Human Rights

Committee raised similar concerns and recommended that the illegal activities of extremist organizations be addressed and alleged hate crimes be investigated.<sup>42</sup>

- 27. The Human Rights Committee remained concerned about reports of racial profiling by law enforcement officers targeting Roma, persons originating from the Caucasus, Central Asia and Africa.<sup>43</sup>
- 28. The same Committee was concerned about reports of discrimination, hate speech, violence against lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender individuals and activists and violations of their rights to freedom of expression and assembly.<sup>44</sup> The Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that the Russian Federation repeal the laws prohibiting propaganda of homosexuality and ensure that children who belonged to lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender or intersex groups or children from lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender or intersex families were not subjected to any form of discrimination.<sup>45</sup>

## 2. Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law<sup>46</sup>

- 29. The Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers welcomed the Government's efforts to strengthen the independence of the judiciary and end the political subordination of judicial actors.<sup>47</sup> The Human Rights Committee was concerned about the selection, appointment, promotion and dismissal of judges, and the disciplinary system for judges.<sup>48</sup> The Special Rapporteur recommended that an independent body oversee the selection and appointment of all judges, and their disciplinary system.<sup>49</sup>
- 30. The Special Rapporteur was alarmed about reports that judges ordered pretrial detention as a rule rather than an exception. She recommended that the law should stipulate the length of time a defendant could be detained.<sup>50</sup> Moreover, defence lawyers should have access to the files of investigative bodies and all the evidence during the investigate phase.<sup>51</sup>
- 31. The Special Rapporteur encouraged the Russian Federation to take measures to tackle corruption and to improve the effectiveness and transparency of the work of bailiffs and other actors in charge of enforcing judicial decisions.<sup>52</sup>
- 32. The ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations requested the Russian Federation to ensure that no sentence entailing compulsory labour could be imposed on persons, who, without using or advocating violence, expressed certain political views or opposition to the established political, social or economic system,<sup>53</sup> in accordance with ILO Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105). The ILO Committee of Experts requested the Russian Federation to provide information on the applications of section 213 of the Criminal Code establishing a penalty of imprisonment or compulsory labour for hooliganism attended by reason of political, ideological, racial, national or religious hatred.<sup>54</sup>

### 3. Fundamental freedoms and the right to participate in public and political life<sup>55</sup>

- 33. The Human Rights Committee remained concerned about reports of harassment, death threats, intimidation, physical violence and killing of lawyers, journalists, human rights defenders and opposition politicians, in particular those working in the North Caucasus, in connection with their professional activities.<sup>56</sup>
- 34. The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights was concerned that the Federal Law on Combatting Extremist Activity might have been arbitrarily used to curb freedom of expression, including political dissent, as well as freedom of religion, due to a vague and open-ended definition of extremist activity.<sup>57</sup> The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination made a similar statement and recommended that the Russian Federation amend the definition of extremism in the Law on Combating Extremism and in articles 280 and 282 of the Criminal Code in accordance with article 4 of the Convention.<sup>58</sup> The Human Rights Committee raised similar concerns.<sup>59</sup>
- 35. The Human Rights Committee was concerned about a number of developments that created a substantial chilling effect on freedom of speech and expression of dissenting political opinions, and recommended that the Russian Federation repeal or revise relevant legislation with a view to bringing them into conformity with its obligations under the Covenant.<sup>60</sup>

- 36. OHCHR recommended that the Russian Federation uphold freedom of opinion and release all persons charged or sentenced for expressing critical or dissenting views, including about political events or the status of Crimea. <sup>61</sup> United Nations human rights experts urged the Russian Federation to fulfil its positive obligation under international human rights law to protect and facilitate the exercise of the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly, freedom of opinion and expression, and freedom of association. <sup>62</sup>
- 37. The Human Rights Committee expressed concern about consistent reports of arbitrary restrictions on the exercise of freedom of peaceful assembly, including violent and unjustified dispersal of protesters, arbitrary detentions and the imposition of harsh fines and prison sentences for the expression of political views.<sup>63</sup>
- 38. United Nations human rights experts condemned attempts to ban the activities of Jehovah's Witnesses using a lawsuit brought under anti-extremism legislation.<sup>64</sup>
- 39. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights was concerned about the wide legal restrictions on the right to strike by workers of municipal services and civil servants who did not exercise authority in the name of the State and by railway workers.<sup>65</sup>
- The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was concerned about the continuous classification of some non-governmental organizations (NGOs) as foreign agents, which impacted their operational activities and, in some instances, led to their closure. 66 The Human Rights Committee, 67 the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, 68 the Committee on the Rights of the Child 69 and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights<sup>70</sup> raised similar concerns. The latter recommended that any legal provisions that unduly restricted the activities of NGOs be repealed or amended and that effective measures be taken to prevent and investigate all forms of harassment, intimidation or threats faced by human rights defenders.<sup>71</sup> The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights was dismayed by the stigmatization of foreign-funded NGOs<sup>72</sup> and expressed concern about Federal Law No. 129-FZ which, as presently worded, might be open to arbitrary interpretation and might also have serious implications for civil society, particularly human rights defenders. 73 The High Commissioner urged the authorities to follow up on recommendations from United Nations human rights mechanisms and to amend the law in line with the international human rights obligations of the Russian Federation.74
- 41. The Human Rights Committee remained concerned about the continued underrepresentation of women in decision-making positions in political and public life, including in the State Duma, the Federal Council and executive bodies.<sup>75</sup> The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women raised similar concerns.<sup>76</sup>

## 4. Prohibition of all forms of slavery<sup>77</sup>

- 42. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned about the lack of sufficient measures to address the root causes of trafficking in persons.<sup>78</sup> The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women was concerned about the absence of a national action plan on trafficking.<sup>79</sup>
- 43. The ILO Committee of Experts requested the Russian Federation to provide victims of trafficking with appropriate protection and assistance such as shelters, crisis centres and reintegration programmes, and to strengthen its international cooperation efforts to combat trafficking in persons and to provide information on specific measures taken in this regard.<sup>80</sup>

## 5. Right to privacy and family life<sup>81</sup>

- 44. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women was concerned that the 2014 family policy had as a goal the renewal of traditional family values focusing on women only as mothers and that it did not include gender equality issues. 82
- 45. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women was concerned at the regulation of family relations in the northern Caucasus, where the concept of "ownership" of the father over his children continues to reign.<sup>83</sup>

## C. Economic, social and cultural rights

- 46. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights recommended that measures be taken to ensure that the tax policy was effective and socially just and addressed economic inequalities and tax evasion.<sup>84</sup>
- 47. The same Committee recommended that the Russian Federation intensifying anticorruption measures, adopt all legislative and administrative measures necessary to ensure transparency in public administration, and ensure effective protection of victims of corruption, whistle-blowers, and their lawyers.<sup>85</sup>

#### 1. Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work<sup>86</sup>

- 48. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women remained concerned at the persistence of the gender pay gap, and about the list of more than 450 occupations and almost 40 branches in which women were precluded from access to the labour market. The Committee called upon the Russian Federation to facilitate women's entry into those jobs by improving working conditions.<sup>87</sup> The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights raised similar concerns.<sup>88</sup>
- 49. The ILO Committee of Experts asked the Russian Federation to take concrete steps to address horizontal and vertical occupational gender segregation and inequalities in remuneration existing in practice between men and women, including measures to address the legal and practical barriers to the employment of women, and stereotypical attitudes and prejudices with a view to reducing inequalities in remuneration.<sup>89</sup>
- 50. The same Committee requested the Russian Federation to take measures to promote equal opportunities for men and women in employment and occupation, including steps to ensure that men and women had equal access to training and employment in the broadest possible range of sectors and industries, as well as at all levels of responsibility. The Committee also requested the Government to include in its legislation a clear definition and prohibition of sexual harassment in employment and occupation; to prevent and address sexual harassment in practice, and to raise awareness of employers, workers and their representatives on this issue.<sup>90</sup>
- 51. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights<sup>91</sup> and the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination<sup>92</sup> were concerned about the working conditions of migrant workers, which were characterized by long working hours, non-payment of wages, wage arrears and the absence of health and safety regulations in the workplace. They were also concerned that informal employment remained widespread in the Russian Federation.
- 52. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was concerned about reports concerning labour exploitation of migrant workers, mostly coming from Central Asian countries and the Caucasus, who are concentrated in the informal economy and whose working conditions are characterised by low salaries, long working hours and no social security.<sup>93</sup>

## 2. Right to social security<sup>94</sup>

- 53. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights was concerned that the social security system in the Russian Federation did not completely cover various population groups, in particular workers in the informal economy, sex workers, migrant workers, minorities and indigenous peoples, as well as some categories of stateless persons.<sup>95</sup>
- 54. The same Committee expressed concern about the high unemployment rates among youth and in rural areas.<sup>96</sup> It was also concerned about the rise in both relative and absolute poverty and about the high poverty levels in rural areas and among children.<sup>97</sup>
- 55. The Committee remained concerned that the minimum wage did not allow workers and their families to have a decent living and that more than 5 million workers earned far less than the minimum subsistence level.<sup>98</sup>

### 3. Right to an adequate standard of living<sup>99</sup>

- 56. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights noted the measures taken by the Russian Federation to increase the availability of affordable housing, including through the family housing programme. It, however, remained concerned about the shortage of social and affordable housing.<sup>100</sup>
- 57. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was concerned about the persistence of forced evictions of the Roma and house demolitions, without offering alternative housing or compensation.<sup>101</sup>

## 4. Right to health<sup>102</sup>

- 58. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights was concerned about the high level of drug use in the Russian Federation and that the State essentially applied a punitive approach to addressing drug problems. The Committee was also concerned about the spread of HIV/AIDS and the prevalence of hepatitis C and tuberculosis, especially among drug users. 103
- 59. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women noted the efforts to further reduce the high abortion rate by reinforcing barriers to access to safe abortion services. It remained concerned that abortion continued to be used as a method of birth control owing to the lack of modern contraceptives. <sup>104</sup> The Committee recommended increasing access for all women and girls, in particular in rural areas, to basic health-care services and removing legal and policy measures aimed at restricting women's access to abortion. <sup>105</sup>

## 5. Right to education 106

- 60. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination<sup>107</sup> and the Committee on the Rights of the Child<sup>108</sup> were concerned about the persistence of de facto segregation of Roma children in schools and the low level of primary education among such children.
- 61. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned about the widespread discrimination against migrant children and asylum-seeking children in the process of admission into schools.<sup>109</sup>
- 62. Considering that education contributes to preventing the engagement of children in the worst forms of child labour, the ILO Committee of Experts urged the Russian Federation to take measures to facilitate children's access to free basic education, especially those from rural areas and from disadvantaged groups. It requested the Government to provide information on measures and achievements in this regard, particularly with respect to school enrolment and dropout rates.<sup>110</sup>

## D. Rights of specific persons or groups

## 1. Women<sup>111</sup>

- 63. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women remained concerned at the persistence of patriarchal attitudes and stereotypes concerning the roles and responsibilities of women and men in the family and in society, which restricted women's educational and professional choices and participation in political and public life and in the labour market. It urged the Russian Federation to put in place a comprehensive strategy to eliminate stereotypes and patriarchal attitudes.<sup>112</sup> The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights raised similar concerns.<sup>113</sup>
- 64. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women remained concerned at the high prevalence of violence against women, in particular domestic and sexual violence. It urged the Russian Federation to introduce ex officio prosecution of domestic and sexual violence and ensure that women and girls who are victims of violence have access to immediate means of redress and that perpetrators are prosecuted and punished.<sup>114</sup>

- 65. The same Committee was concerned at the reports of widespread violence and discrimination against women in prostitution, and the absence of reintegration programmes for women.<sup>115</sup>
- 66. The Human Rights Committee noted with concern the lack of due diligence on the part of law enforcement officers in investigating domestic violence cases, and that support services for victims, including the number of psychological and educational centres and shelters, were insufficient. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights recommended that the Russian Federation repeal the amendment of the Criminal Code that decriminalized the first offence of domestic violence with a view to protecting all victims of domestic violence and preventing impunity. 117
- 67. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned about the reports of violence against women and girls in the North Caucasus, including the so-called "honour killings" and "bride kidnapping", as well as about the persistence of child marriages of girls and polygamy in that region. 118 The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women raised similar concerns. 119

#### 2. Children<sup>120</sup>

- 68. The Committee on the Rights of the Child remained concerned about the large number of cases of sexual exploitation and abuse of children and the lack of cooperation between the law enforcement agencies and the social system to prevent such offences or to rehabilitate victims of sexual violence and sexual abuse.<sup>121</sup>
- 69. The same Committee was concerned about the widespread practice of children being forcibly separated from their parents in application of articles 69 and 73 of the Family Code, and the lack of support and assistance to reunite families. <sup>122</sup> The Committee recommended that the Russian Federation consider ratifying the Hague Convention on Protection of Children and Cooperation in respect of Intercountry Adoption. <sup>123</sup>
- 70. The ILO Committee of Experts requested the Russian Federation to pursue its efforts to ensure the elimination of the sale and trafficking of children and young persons under 18 years of age in practice, by ensuring that thorough investigations and robust prosecutions of persons who engage in the sale and trafficking of children are carried out and that sufficiently effective and dissuasive penalties are imposed. It also requested the Government to strengthen its efforts to provide for the removal, rehabilitation and social reintegration of child victims of trafficking.<sup>124</sup>
- 71. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned that large numbers of children live and work on the streets, where they are vulnerable to abuse, including sexual abuse, and to other forms of exploitation to such an extent that regular school attendance is restricted. The Committee was also concerned at the high incidence of suicide and of drug and alcohol addiction among adolescents in the Russian Federation, and about the reports of coercive treatment of transsexual and homosexual persons, in particular children. Page 126
- 72. The ILO Committee of Experts requested the Russian Federation to pursue its efforts to effectively address and eliminate child labour, and to ensure that all children under 16 years of age, including those who work on their own account or in the informal economy, benefit from the protection afforded by ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138). 127 Recalling that children living and working on the street are particularly vulnerable to the worst forms of child labour, the Committee urged the Government to take the necessary measures to protect these children, particularly girls, from the worst forms of child labour. 128
- 73. The Committee on the Rights of the Child recommended that the Russian Federation ban military training involving the use of firearms and combat training for children under the age of 18 in both general and military schools.<sup>129</sup>
- 74. The same Committee was concerned that the Russian Federation had failed to investigate cases of alleged involvement of children in non-State armed groups and cases where children had fallen victim to hostilities during the conflicts in the Chechen Republic of the Russian Federation. <sup>130</sup> The Committee recommended that the Russian Federation

amend its Criminal Code to add provisions that explicitly criminalized the recruitment of all children under the age of 18 by the Armed Forces or by non-State armed groups and the use, involvement and participation of children in hostilities.<sup>131</sup>

75. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was also concerned at reports of the export of arms by the Russian Federation to numerous countries, where children were used by armed groups and fell victim to armed conflict. The Committee recommended that the Russian Federation put in place mechanisms to identify at an early stage refugee, asylumseeking and migrant children coming from countries where there were or had been armed conflicts and who may have been involved in armed conflict.

## 3. Persons with disabilities<sup>134</sup>

76. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned at the widespread institutionalization of children with disabilities and the absence of comprehensive social, psychological, medical, educational or legal assistance for families. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights made similar remarks.

## 4. Minorities and indigenous peoples<sup>137</sup>

- 77. The ILO Committee of Experts requested the Russian Federation to strengthen the enforcement of the provision on non-discrimination in the Labour Code, with particular emphasis on discrimination on racial or ethnic grounds and national origin, and to promote equality of opportunity and treatment of indigenous peoples in education, training, employment and occupation, including their right to engage without discrimination in their traditional occupations and livelihoods as well as in non-traditional activities. The Committee also requested the Government to provide information on the current position in the labour market of the different national and ethnic minorities.<sup>138</sup>
- 78. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination recommended that the Russian Federation restore the rights of the Shor peoples, in close consultation with the Shor representatives and bodies, and guarantee that the principle of free, prior and informed consent is respected in all decisions affecting Shor people.<sup>139</sup>
- 79. The same Committee was concerned that the legal definition of indigenous peoples in the Russian Federation imposed a numerical ceiling of 50,000 individuals beyond which a self-identified indigenous group may not be classified as indigenous, and was thus prevented from enjoying legal protection of their lands, resources and livelihoods.<sup>140</sup>

#### 5. Migrants, refugees, asylum seekers and internally displaced persons<sup>141</sup>

- 80. UNHCR indicated that a new Federal Law on Asylum had been in the process of being developed since 2010–2011 and should be passed in the first half of 2018.
- 81. UNHCR noted that asylum seekers who could not access the asylum procedure remained in the country illegally and faced the risk of detention and refoulement. They also lacked a legal source of income and did not have access to medical assistance and their children did not attend schools. The problems were most acute in the Moscow, St. Petersburg and Leningrad regions. UNHCR recommended that the Russian Federation ensure unhindered access to its territory and to asylum procedures for all asylum seekers, without discrimination, including from detention centres and transit zones; and adhere to the principle of non-penalization for illegal entry or presence for asylum seekers, with adequate safeguards against arbitrary detention and deportation before an application for asylum has been officially registered and adjudicated on. 142
- 82. The Human Rights Committee recommended that the Russian Federation ensure that asylum seekers who might be in need of international protection were able to access asylum procedures, more specifically by establishing accessible asylum and referral procedures at all border points, international airports and transit zones, and prevent the refoulement of asylum seekers and persons granted protection on its territory, in line with articles 6, 7 and 13 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and ensure respect for requests for interim measures issued by international human rights bodies.<sup>143</sup>

83. OHCHR recommended that the Russian Federation refrain from forcibly deporting and/or transferring Ukrainian citizens who did not have Russian Federation passports from Crimea, <sup>144</sup> enable unimpeded freedom of movement to and from Crimea, and end deportations of Crimean residents pursuant to Russian Federation immigration rules. <sup>145</sup>

#### 6. Stateless persons

- 84. While noting some measures taken to simplify residency registration procedures, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination remained concerned about the high number of persons still not registered in the Russian Federation, including stateless persons, refugees and holders of temporary asylum and individuals belonging to some minority groups.<sup>146</sup>
- 85. The Committee on the Rights of the Child was concerned about reports that children born to Roma, refugee and asylum-seeking mothers with non-Russian passports or without identity documents were denied birth registration.<sup>147</sup>

## E. Specific regions or territories

- 86. The General Assembly underscored that the referendum held in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol of 16 March 2014 had no validity and therefore could not form the basis for any alteration of the status of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea or of the city of Sevastopol.<sup>148</sup>
- 87. The General Assembly condemned the abuses, measures and practices of discrimination against the resident of the temporarily occupied Crimea, including Crimean Tatars, as well as Ukrainians and persons belonging to other ethnic and religious groups, by the Russian occupation authorities. <sup>149</sup> The Assembly urged the Russian Federation to, inter alia, take all necessary measures to bring an immediate end to all abuses against residents of Crimea, in particular reported discriminatory measures and practices, arbitrary detentions, torture and other cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment, and to revoke all discriminatory legislation; <sup>150</sup> immediately released Ukrainian citizens who were unlawfully detained and judged without regard to elementary standards of justice, as well as those transferred across internationally recognized borders from Crimea to the Russian Federation. <sup>151</sup>
- 88. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination noted that Crimea was under the effective control of the Russian Federation. <sup>152</sup> OHCHR recommended that the Russian Federation uphold human rights in Crimea for all and respect obligations that applied to an occupying power pursuant to international humanitarian law provisions; <sup>153</sup> apply Ukrainian laws in Crimea, pursuant to General Assembly resolutions 68/262 and 71/205; <sup>154</sup> and end the practice of retroactive application of penal laws to acts committed before the occupation of Crimea, and refrain from using law enforcement bodies and the justice system to pressure and intimidate opponents. <sup>155</sup>
- The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was particularly concerned about the ban and strict limitations on the operation of Crimean Tatar representative institutions, such as the outlawing of the Mejlis and the closure of several media outlets, and about violations of the human rights of Crimean Tatars, including allegations of disappearances, criminal and administrative prosecutions, mass raids and interrogations. The Committee was further concerned about restrictions on using and studying the Ukrainian language since the conflict erupted in 2014. The Committee recommended that the Russian Federation allow OHCHR full access to Crimea to take stock of the human rights situation. 156 The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights was concerned about restrictions faced by Crimean Tatars and ethnic Ukrainians in exercising their economic, social and cultural rights, particularly the rights to work, to express their own identity and culture, and to education in the Ukrainian language. 157 The General Assembly urged the Russian Federation to, inter alia, revoke immediately the decision declaring the Mejlis of the Crimean Tartar People an extremist organization and banning its activities, and repeal the decision banning leaders of the Mejlis from entering Crimea.158

- 90. The Special Rapporteur on the negative impact of unilateral coercive measures on the enjoyment of human rights reiterated his call on the Russian Federation to ensure the proper and unimpeded access of international human rights monitoring missions to Crimea, in accordance with its national legislation and relevant international law standards. <sup>159</sup> OHCHR recommended that the Russian Federation implement General Assembly resolution 71/205, including by ensuring proper and unimpeded access of international human rights monitoring missions and human rights NGOs to Crimea. <sup>160</sup>
- 91. The Human Rights Committee was concerned about reported violations of the Covenant in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol, which were under the control of the Russian Federation, including allegations of serious human rights violations, many of which involved the "Crimean self-defence" forces, enforced disappearances, abductions, arbitrary detention, ill-treatment and attacks against journalists and alleged violations of freedom of expression and information and harassment of the media. <sup>161</sup> OHCHR recommended that the Russian Federation investigate all allegations of torture and ill-treatment made by individuals deprived of liberty in Crimea, including those accused of terrorism- and separatism-related charges. <sup>162</sup> OHCHR also recommended that the Russian Federation ensure accountability for human rights violations and abuses through investigations of allegations of ill-treatment, torture, abductions, disappearances and killings involving members of the security forces and the Crimean self-defence; bringing perpetrators to justice and provide redress for victims. <sup>163</sup>
- 92. The Human Rights Committee was concerned about reports alleging serious violations in the Donbas region of Ukraine by forces over which the Russian Federation appears to have considerable influence.<sup>164</sup>
- 93. OHCHR recommended that the Russian Federation ensure that the rights to freedom of expression, peaceful assembly, association, thought, conscience and religion can be exercised by any individual and group in Crimea, without discrimination on any grounds, including race, nationality, political views or ethnicity. OHCHR also recommended that the Russian Federation stop applying legislation on extremism, terrorism and separatism to criminalize free speech and peaceful conduct, and release all persons arrested and charged for expressing dissenting views, including regarding the status of Crimea. OHCHR 166
- 94. OHCHR also recommended that the Russian Federation respect religious convictions and practices, including by providing alternative military service for conscientious objectors, and reverse the decision to deregister Jehovah's Witnesses congregations in Crimea.<sup>167</sup>
- 95. OHCHR further recommended that the Russian Federation ensure access of all Crimean residents, including those without Russian Federation passports, to employment, health treatment, property and public services, without discrimination.<sup>168</sup>

#### Notes

- Tables containing information on the scope of international obligations and cooperation with international human rights mechanisms and bodies for the Russian Federation will be available at www.ohchr.org/EN/Countries/ENACARegion/Pages/RUIndex.aspx.
- <sup>2</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.1–140.22, 140.55, 140.64–140.74. The views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies of the Russian Federation can be found in A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>3</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 60.
- <sup>4</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 24.
- <sup>5</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 15.
- <sup>6</sup> See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 53.
- <sup>7</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 33.
- <sup>8</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 61.
- 9 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 72.
- <sup>10</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 29.
- <sup>11</sup> See UNHCR submission for the universal periodic review of the Russian Federation, p. 3.
- <sup>12</sup> See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 72.
- <sup>13</sup> See CRC/C/OPAC/RUS/CO/1, para. 22.
- OHCHR, "Donor profiles", in OHCHR Report 2013, p. 183; "Donor profiles", in OHCHR Report 2014, p. 118; "Donor profiles" in OHCHR Report 2015, p. 114; and "Donor profiles" in OHCHR Report 2016, p. 134.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.24–140.31, 140.33, 140.48 and 140.60–140.63. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>16</sup> See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 16.
- <sup>17</sup> See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 14.
- <sup>18</sup> See UNHCR submission, p. 1.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.75–140.76, 140.80–140.95, 140.97 and 140.138. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>20</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, paras. 9–10.
- <sup>21</sup> See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 9.
- <sup>22</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 22.
- <sup>23</sup> See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=21501&LangID=E.
- <sup>24</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 15.
- <sup>25</sup> Ibid., para. 17.
- $^{26}\,$  For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.64 and 140.230. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>27</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 20.
- <sup>28</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 23.
- $^{29}~$  See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, paras. 14–15.
- <sup>30</sup> See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 20.
- <sup>31</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 11.
- <sup>32</sup> See A/HRC/36/44/Add.1, paras. 67–68.
- <sup>33</sup> For the relevant recommendation, see A/HRC/24/14, para. 140.231. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>34</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 13.
- 35 Ibid.
- <sup>36</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 7 (a).
- <sup>37</sup> Ibid., para. 7 (b).
- <sup>38</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.96, 140.98–140.104, 140.116–140.119, 140.132–140.135, 140.187–140.192. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>39</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 14.
- 40 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 30.
- <sup>41</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 15.
- 42 See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 8.
- <sup>43</sup> Ibid., para. 9.
- <sup>44</sup> Ibid., para. 10.
- 45 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 25.
- <sup>46</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.105, 140.120–140.125, 140.127–140.131, 140.137 and 140.139. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>47</sup> See A/HRC/26/32/Add.1, para. 89.

- <sup>48</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 17.
- <sup>49</sup> See A/HRC/26/32/Add.1, paras. 97 and 105.
- <sup>50</sup> Ibid., paras. 41, 111–112.
- <sup>51</sup> Ibid., para. 116.
- <sup>52</sup> Ibid., para. 122.
- 53 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3298628.
- 54 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3298632.
- <sup>55</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.65, 140.144–140.154, 140.156–140.163, 140.166–140.168, 140.170–140.184, 140.186 and 140.193. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>56</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 18.
- <sup>57</sup> http://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=21316&LangID=E.
- <sup>58</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, paras. 11–12.
- <sup>59</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 20.
- 60 See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 19; see also the follow-up letter sent by the Human Rights Committee's Special Rapporteur for follow-up to concluding observations to the Russian Federation on April 18, 2017, available at http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/ Shared%20Documents/RUS/INT\_CCPR\_FUL\_RUS\_27219\_E.pdf.
- 61 A/HRC/36/CRP.2, para. 184 (b).
- <sup>62</sup> See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=21461&LangID=E.
- 63 See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 21.
- <sup>64</sup> See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=21479&LangID=E.
- 65 See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 34.
- 66 See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 11.
- 67 See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 22.
- 68 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, paras. 15–16.
- 69 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 19.
- <sup>70</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, paras. 7–8.
- 71 Ibid
- <sup>72</sup> See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=16414&LangID=E.
- <sup>73</sup> See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=16074&LangID=E.
- <sup>74</sup> See www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=20086&LangID=E.
- <sup>75</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 11.
- <sup>76</sup> See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 27.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.116–140.117, 140.119 and 140.190–140.192. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>78</sup> See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 67.
- <sup>79</sup> See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 25.
- 80 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3299902.
- <sup>81</sup> For relevant recommendations see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.155. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- 82 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 33.
- 83 Ibid., para. 45.
- 84 See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 17.
- 85 Ibid., para. 19.
- <sup>86</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.79 and 140.202. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- 87 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 33; also www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/Display News.aspx?NewsID=17226&LangID=E.
- 88 See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, paras. 28–29.
- 89 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3187524:NO.
- 90 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3187540:NO.
- 91 See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 32.
- <sup>92</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 27.
- 93 Ibid
- $^{94}\,$  For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, para. 140.198. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>95</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 36.
- <sup>96</sup> Ibid., para. 26.
- <sup>97</sup> Ibid., para. 44.
- 98 Ibid., para. 30.

- <sup>99</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.197 and 140.200–140.201. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>100</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 46.
- <sup>101</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 21.
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.203–140.204 and 140.210. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>103</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 50.
- 104 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 35.
- <sup>105</sup> Ibid. para. 36 (a).
- For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.205–140.206. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>107</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 21.
- 108 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 59.
- <sup>109</sup> Ibid.
- 110 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3298826:NO.
- 111 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.51, 140.54, 140.77–140.79, 140.106–140.115 and 140.142. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- 112 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, paras. 19–20.
- <sup>113</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 25.
- <sup>114</sup> See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, paras. 21–22; also CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8/Add.1.
- 115 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 25.
- 116 See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 12.
- <sup>117</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 39.
- <sup>118</sup> See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 37.
- 119 See CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/8, para. 23.
- 120 For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.43–140.47. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- 121 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 35.
- <sup>122</sup> Ibid., para. 41.
- <sup>123</sup> Ibid., para. 44.
- 124 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3298822.
- 125 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 65.
- <sup>126</sup> Ibid., para. 55.
- 127 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3300476.
- 128 See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3298826:NO.
- <sup>129</sup> See CRC/C/OPAC/RUS/CO/1, paras. 10–11.
- <sup>130</sup> Ibid., para. 16.
- <sup>131</sup> Ibid., para. 15.
- <sup>132</sup> Ibid., para. 23.
- <sup>133</sup> Ibid., para. 21.
- <sup>134</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.53 and 140.213–140.216. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- 135 See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 49.
- <sup>136</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 40.
- <sup>137</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.34–140.42, 140.52 and 140.217–140.223. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>138</sup> See www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100\_COMMENT\_ ID:3187540:NO.
- <sup>139</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 26. See also http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CERD/Shared%20Documents/RUS/INT\_CERD\_FUL\_RUS\_ 20672 E.pdf.
- <sup>140</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 23.
- <sup>141</sup> For relevant recommendations, see A/HRC/24/14, paras. 140.226–140.229. See also A/HRC/24/14/Add.1.
- <sup>142</sup> See UNHCR submission, p. 4.
- <sup>143</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, paras. 15–16.
- <sup>144</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.2, para. 184 (c).
- <sup>145</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.3, para 226 (k).
- <sup>146</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, para. 29.

- <sup>147</sup> See CRC/C/RUS/CO/4-5, para. 28.
- <sup>148</sup> See General Assembly resolution 68/262, para. 5.
- <sup>149</sup> See General Assembly resolution 71/205, para.1.
- <sup>150</sup> Ibid., para. 2 (b).
- <sup>151</sup> Ibid., para. 2 (c).
- <sup>152</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, paras. 9–10; and CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, paras. 19–20.
- <sup>153</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.3, para 226 (a).
- <sup>154</sup> Ibid., para 226 (c).
- <sup>155</sup> Ibid., para 226 (g).
- <sup>156</sup> See CERD/C/RUS/CO/23-24, paras. 19–20 and 38.
- <sup>157</sup> See E/C.12/RUS/CO/6, para. 9–10.
- <sup>158</sup> See General Assembly resolution 71/205, para. 2 (g).
- <sup>159</sup> See A/HRC/36/44/Add.1, para. 73.
- <sup>160</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.2, para. 184 (a).
- <sup>161</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 23.
- <sup>162</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.2, para. 184 (d).
- <sup>163</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.3, para 226 (d).
- <sup>164</sup> See CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, para. 6.
- <sup>165</sup> See A/HRC/36/CRP.3, para 226 (l).
- <sup>166</sup> Ibid., para 226 (m).
- <sup>167</sup> Ibid., para. 184 (e).
- <sup>168</sup> Ibid., para 226 (r).