

Flygtningenævnets baggrundsmateriale

Bilagsnr.:	221
Land:	Rusland
Kilde:	Observatory for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders
Titel:	Steadfast in protest, annual report 2010, Russia.
Udgivet:	13. september 2010
Optaget på baggrundsmaterialet:	21. januar 2011

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

OBSERVATORY FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS DEFENDERS
ANNUAL REPORT 2010

Political context

In Russia, the year 2009 was marked by an unprecedented number of murders and violent attacks on human rights defenders and independent journalists. These attacks were intended to establish a reign of terror¹. Government measures to identify, try and sentence the culprits and, more generally, to ensure the protection of human rights defenders, independent journalists and members of the opposition remained insufficient. There was a general climate of insecurity and violence throughout the country. Fascist groups continued to make xenophobic speeches as the number of public demonstrations and racist crimes and attacks increased². In parallel, the idea that Russia is invaded by an uncontrollable flood of migrants who have come to steal work from Russians was widely relayed in the press and in official speeches, giving legitimacy to the stigmatisation and impunity for the attacks endured by defenders of migrants' and minorities' rights. Insecurity was aggravated by the general climate of impunity that reigned in the country, the violence commonly used by the police force, and by a defective legal system. Faced with this situation, at the end of December 2009 the Russian President promised to revise the judicial system, the police and the prisons.

Moreover, the Russian President's promises to democratise the country resulted in little that was concrete. The opposition still had considerable difficulty in making itself heard and there was no end to attacks on freedom of expression. Dissident voices were harshly repressed and were still considered as threats. Once again this year, demonstrations by the "nesoglasnikh"

1/ A symbolic case is that of the Ingush activist Mr. Maksharip Aushev, the owner and former Editor-in-chief of the opposition website www.ingushetiya.ru. He was shot dead on October 25, 2009. A member of the Experts' Council for the North Caucasus attached to the Russian Human Rights Ombudsman, he had been threatened on several occasions before his murder and had escaped an attempt to kidnap him on September 15, 2009.

2/ For instance, on November 4, 2009, the concert by the Russian fascist cult rock group Kolovrat brought thousands of neo-Nazis together to chant racist slogans in complete freedom in the centre of Moscow. The fact that this kind of assembly might be permitted led to the belief that these groups benefit from special protection on the part of the authorities, which is a cause for concern for human rights defenders. See Russian Research Centre for Human Rights (HRO). Furthermore, the warnings given by the Young Europe organisation concerning fascist meetings provoked no reaction from the Prosecutor. See *Caucasian Knot*. According to the Moscow Bureau for Human Rights (MBHR), from January 1 to December 15, 2009, 75 people were killed and 282 people were injured following attacks of a racist nature. During the same period, 300 people were prosecuted for racist crimes. Most of them were sentenced.

movement, the “Dissenters’ marches” that call for a “Russia without Putin”, were brutally dispersed and accompanied by arrests. In addition, the last day of the year was marked by the arrest of 50 people during a demonstration calling for freedom of assembly in Moscow, amongst whom was the former Soviet dissident, founder and President of the Moscow Helsinki Group, Ms. **Liudmila Alexeeva**³.

Furthermore, the security situation worsened throughout the North Caucasus in 2009. Although in April 2009, ten years after the war had started again in Chechnya, President Dmitri Medvedev announced the end of the “anti-terrorist operation” and that the work of reconstruction would continue, the security situation in the republic of the North Caucasus continued to be of great concern. Under cover of apparent “normalisation”, abductions, enforced disappearances, acts of torture and murders continued while the Chechen President Ramzan Kadyrov established a reign of terror, at the same time cultivating a form of cult of personality and exercising power that is almost absolute. Despite efforts by the current President of Ingushetia, Mr. Yunous-Bek Yevkurov, to begin a dialogue with human rights organisations and civil society associations, together with his willingness to reform the bodies responsible for implementing the law, the situation in the small neighbouring republic of Chechnya worsened in 2009, as was the case for the rest of North Caucasus. The atrocities committed by the forces of law and order and agents of the Federal Security Service (FSB, formerly the KGB) in Dagestan and Ingushetia in particular, such as acts of torture, arbitrary detentions and abductions, fuelled the revolt of young people who swell the ranks of the Islamic groups. Attacks on State representatives increased, as demonstrated by the killing of the Dagestan Minister of the Interior, Mr. Adilgerey Magomedtagirov, on June 5, 2009 and the attack on the Ingush President on June 22, 2009. Instability, corruption, arbitrary acts and impunity reigned throughout the other republics of North Caucasus. Finally, the crimes committed in the past and that continued to be committed in the context of the fight against terrorism went unpunished. In this context, defenders who denounced these atrocities and impunity for them were subjected to brutal repression.

Serious persecution of defenders in the North Caucasus

Killings, attacks, threats and harassment of defenders in Chechnya

During the summer of 2009, the Chechen authorities publicly accused members of human rights organisations of being “enemies of the Republic”

and “accomplices of terrorist groups”. As an example, on June 24, 2009, the Chechen President, criticising work by experts who contested the so-called “stabilisation” of the republic, in which the “Memorial” Human Rights Centre had in particular participated, announced on the *Grozny* television channel that he connected the activities of the authors of the report “with banditry, terrorism, criminality”. On July 1, 2009, Mr. Adam Delimkhanov, a member of the Duma close to Mr. Kadyrov, also spoke in hostile terms on the *Grozny* channel about human rights defenders, saying that they “help these devils [i.e. terrorists and fighters] and defend their interests and their actions”. “They do just as much damage as the ones that hide in the woods (...). These devils, these terrorists, the ones that help and support them, we will destroy them”.

This clear hostility was accompanied by murders, attacks and serious threats against defenders. On July 15, 2009, Ms. **Natalia Estemirova**, a member of Memorial, was kidnapped in Grozny and murdered; her brutal death immensely traumatised the community of defenders in Russia and worldwide. The President of the Chechen Republic had personally threatened Ms. Estemirova because of her investigation into cases of abduction, enforced disappearances and summary executions in Chechnya. Following her murder, several other members of the Memorial office in Grozny were threatened. On July 17, 2009 Memorial therefore decided to close the offices of the organisation in Chechnya⁴. In August 2009, the organisation’s employees were the subject of surveillance and pressure. This persecution in particular concerned Mr. **Akhmed Guissaev**, who helped Ms. Natalia Estemirova on the case of the abduction of two men in Grozny on June 28, 2009. Mr. Guissaev had been under surveillance by unknown persons since the beginning of the month of July 2009. This surveillance continued after the killing of Ms. Estemirova, while Mr Guissaev continued the investigation. During the evening of August 13, 2009, unknown armed persons checked Mr. Guissaev’s papers. In addition, Chechen “siloviki” (members of the Government forces of law and order) placed the Grozny premises of the organisation under surveillance. Following serious threats, several members of Memorial also had to leave the country. Furthermore, on August 11, 2009, the President of the organisation “Save the Generation”, a support association for handicapped children, Ms. **Zarema Sadulayeva**, and her husband, Mr. **Umar Dzhabrailov**, were abducted and killed. Their bodies were found in their car and bore traces of torture. The fact that their abduction took place in broad daylight and that the assailants’ faces were not covered leads to the suspicion that the authors of the crime were

4/ They were re-opened on December 16, 2009.

members of the security forces. At the end of 2009, a criminal investigation had been opened but no suspect had been arrested. On October 31, Ms. **Zarema Gaissanova**, a member of the Grozny branch of the Danish Refugee Council, was abducted from her home. Her attackers, probably members of the security forces, also shot at her house, which they partially burned. As of the end of 2009, Ms. Gaissanova's whereabouts remained unknown. On November 9, 2009, the Prosecutor's representative simply informed the mother of the victim that the latter was still alive.

The campaign to discredit members of Memorial and other human rights organisations continued in parallel with these attacks. For instance, in an interview for the newspaper *Zavtra* that was published on September 24, 2009, President Kadyrov accused Memorial of being an association created to "destroy Russia". Similarly, the Chechen Republic Human Rights Commissioner assimilated *Caucasian Knot*, the independent news website responsible for numerous articles on violations in the Caucasus, to a terrorist website. In an interview given on *Radio Freedom* shortly after the murder of Ms. Estemirova, President Ramzan Kadyrov denigrated the defender's work, stating that it was of no interest, and described the activist as a person who had "never had any honour or decency". The Chechen President also filed a complaint against Mr. **Oleg Orlov**, President of the Memorial executive office, for "defamation", demanding 10 million roubles in damages and interest for "moral prejudice". This complaint was made after Mr. Orlov had accused on July 15, 2009 the President of being responsible for the murder of Ms. Estemirova, on Memorial website. On October 6, 2009, the Tverskoy Court sentenced the association to pay a fine of 50,000 roubles (1,140 euros) and Mr. Orlov to a fine of 20,000 roubles (450 euros). In parallel, a criminal investigation was opened against Mr. Orlov on October 20, 2009 by the Central Department of Internal Affairs (GUVI), for "defamation". At the end of 2009, Mr. Orlov, who risked a prison sentence, and one of his colleagues, Ms. **Svetlana Ganuchkina**, were questioned by the police services but no charge was held against them⁵.

Intensification of the repression of defenders throughout the region

All the republics of North Caucasus were also affected by repression. For example, in Dagestan, during the night of August 19 to 20, 2009, a fire was criminally started in the premises of the "Mothers of Dagestan for Human Rights" organisation in Makhachkala, which were totally destroyed. All of the organisation's documents and other property, includ-

410 5/ On February 9, 2010, the Chechen President announced that he would withdraw his complaint.

ing computer equipment, went up in smoke, depriving the organisation of its main working tools. A criminal investigation was opened in the month of October 2009 but, as of the end of 2009, no prosecution had been initiated⁶. In addition, at the beginning of September, hundreds of leaflets were distributed in the town of Makhachkala containing hostile messages against defenders, lawyers and journalists. The authors of the tracts, presenting themselves as “family members of murdered policemen”, called for revenge and openly threatened 250 people with death. Amongst those named were Ms. **Svetlana Isayeva**, Director of the organisation “Mothers of Dagestan for Human Rights”, two Memorial colleagues, Ms. **Bakanay Guseynova** and Mr. **Zaur Gaziye**, and Mr. **Isalmagomed Nabiye**, a human rights activist⁷.

Impunity for killings and attacks against defenders in the rest of the country

Killings and attacks against defenders were not restricted to North Caucasus, but were carried out throughout the Russian Federation. On March 31, 2009, Mr. **Lev Ponomarev**, Director of the Public Movement “For Human Rights”, was the victim of a particularly violent attack that led to him being hospitalised. In 2008, Mr. Ponomarev had tried to alert the police to the fact that he was being followed, without the latter taking any steps to ensure his safety. At the end of 2009, the case was termed as “banditry committed by a group formed by prior agreement” (Article 162.2 of the Criminal Code), but no arrest had been made.

At the same time, investigations into murders and attacks on defenders saw little progress and no investigation was made into the real people behind the attacks – evidence of the incompetence or the authorities’ lack of willingness to bring those really responsible for the murders of defenders to justice. As an example, as of the end of 2009 it was still not known who was behind the killing of the journalist Ms. **Anna Politkovskaya** on October 7, 2006. On February 19, 2009, the Moscow Military Court acquitted the persons who had until then been accused of carrying out the killing. On June 25, 2009, the Supreme Court quashed the verdict and, on September 3, 2009, ordered the case to be sent back to court and a new

6/ The criminal nature of the fire was confirmed by an agent of the Ministry of Emergency Situations, who found pieces of newspaper soaked in petrol under the window of the premises. After the fire, the Sovetsky district police station in Makhachkala (ROVD) had nevertheless refused to register the complaint filed by Ms. Svetlana Isayeva: it was claimed that an assessment had been carried out by experts from the Ministry of Emergency Situations, attributing the fire to a short circuit in the cabling on the premises. However, at the time of the fire, the current to the office had been cut off two and a half weeks previously. None of the machines was plugged in. See Mothers of Dagestan for Human Rights.

7/ See Memorial.

investigation to be opened. In addition, as of the end of 2009, no-one had been identified as being responsible for the attacks carried out in 2008 against Ms. **Carine Clément**, a French sociologist and defender of social rights in Russia, Mr. **Mikhail Beketov**, Editor-in-chief of *Khimkinskaya Pravda*, a newspaper that denounces local authority corruption, and an activist to safeguard the forest from building projects, and Mr. **Sergey Fedotov**, a defender of the rights of smallholders in the Moscow suburbs. In addition, with regard to Mr. Beketov, who remained in a coma for several weeks after being attacked, a criminal investigation was opened under Article 111 of the Criminal Code for “intention to seriously damage health” and not for “attempted murder”⁸. The investigation was ongoing as of the end of 2009.

Killings, attacks, threats and harassment against defenders who combat discrimination, racism and right-wing extremist groups

In 2009, once again, members of organisations that combat racism and the activities of extreme right-wing movements were victims of violence by neo-Nazi groups that issue increasingly frequent calls for the elimination of defenders and publish on Internet lists of the names and contact details of the persons targeted. The beginning of the year was marked by the killing on January 19, 2009 of the lawyer Mr. **Stanislav Markelov** and the *Novaya Gazeta* journalist, Ms. **Anastasia Baburova**, who accompanied him. Mr. Markelov was investigating the atrocities committed by the forces of law and order in Chechnya and was defending victims of the Nord Ost tragedy. The investigation that followed the killing led to the arrest and conviction for of Messrs. **Nikita Tikhonov** and **Evgenya Khacis** on November 3 and 4, 2009⁹. According to the statements of the accused, they killed Mr. Markelov because he was defending persons belonging to the anti-fascist movement. On November 16, 2009, Mr. **Ivan Khutorskoy**, one of the young anti-fascist movement activists, was found dead on the landing of his Moscow apartment building with two bullets in his head. The young 26 year-old activist had been violently attacked with a knife on three occasions since 2005. His name and address were included on neo-Nazi websites calling for him to be killed. Shortly after his murder, the person in charge of the Prosecutor's Investigation Committee stated that he did not exclude the possibility that the murder was linked to the young man's anti-fascist activities. The investigation was ongoing as of the end of 2009¹⁰. Similarly, threats against the “SOVA” Centre for Information

8/ *Idem*.

9/ Mr. Markelov was attempting to incriminate the same two people for the murder of a young anti-fascist. See HRO.

412 10/ See HRO.

and Analysis¹¹ intensified in 2009. On February 8, 2009, the day before the publication of a report on the issue of nationalism and racism in Russia, Ms. **Galina Kozhevnikova**, Vice-President of the SOVA Centre, received death threats by e-mail informing her that she would soon join Mr. Markelov and the anti-racist activist Mr. **Nikolai Guireenko**, murdered in 2004. At the beginning of the year, unknown persons tried to enter the apartment of Mr. **Alexander Verkhovsky**, the Centre Director. The latter had already been the victim of such intrusions in July 2008 and his name and address were included in a list published on the extreme right website *www.vdesyatki.net*. An investigation had then been opened for “revealing personal information” and “death threats”. A new investigation was opened but, as of the end of 2009, no suspect had been identified in either of the two investigations.

The extreme right threat is all the greater because the neo-Nazi movements can express themselves in complete freedom. In July 2009, Mr. **Konstantin Baranov**, in charge of the Rostov-on-the-Don branch of the Young Europe organisation, which promotes the values of tolerance and combats racism, received threats after taking steps to warn the Prosecutor that neo-Nazis would meet in the city of Rostov-on-the-Don. On July 15, 2009, a web page on the Internet site of a member of the Slavic Union extreme right movement published Mr. Baranov's contact details and a call to “all extreme right sympathisers in Russia” to take “appropriate” action in response to the initiatives of the defender. New threats were published on the same site after Mr. Baranov alerted the SOVA Centre. In Krasnodar, on October 12, 2009, an illegal control¹² was made of the “ETHnICS” association for the promotion of tolerance by the Department of Economic Crimes (OBEP). Three computers were seized and OBEP agents tried to arrest Ms. **Anastasia Denisova**, President of the organisation, member of the coordinating committee of the Youth Human Rights Movement and the Citizens' Union for a Green Alternative (GROZA) and a collaborator of Memorial. Ms. Denisova refused to submit to being arrested since there was no warrant. Following this search, in December 2009, a criminal investigation was opened against Ms. Denisova for “violation of copyright in the course of her job” on the basis of Article 146.3 § D of the Criminal Code, liable to a six years' prison sentence and a fine of 500,000 roubles

11/ The SOVA Centre is an organisation that monitors and analyses displays of racism and xenophobia and studies relations between the churches and secular society, as well as political radicalism in Russia.

12/ A complaint that the organisation used pirated software was used as grounds for the search. However, the complaint did not correspond to the address of the office.

(12,400 euros)¹³. Finally, on October 4, 2009, she was stopped at Krasnodar airport and prevented from attending a human rights meeting organised by the OSCE. The day after the search, on October 13, 2009, fearing new reprisals, Ms. Denisova left Krasnodar. In September 2009, Ms. Denisova had additionally been the victim of a slander campaign in the Krasnodar municipal newsletter¹⁴.

Judicial harassment of defenders of the rights of detainees

In the context of considerable concern regarding the state of prisons in Russia and in which the rights of prisoners are not respected, people who denounce the situation are deemed to be an obstacle to the stability of the Russian State and are legally prosecuted for their activities to defend the rights of detainees. The Volgograd correspondent of the *Svobodnoe slovo* (Free Speech) newspaper, Ms. Elena Maglevannaya, was sentenced on May 12, 2009 by the Kirov District Court in Volgograd to pay 200,000 roubles (4,613 euros) in damages and interest to the Volgograd penitentiary, in accordance with Article 152 of the Civil Code relating to the "honour and protection of a professional reputation". This sentence was related to articles by the journalist published in several newspapers and on Internet on the detention conditions of a Chechen prisoner and the ill-treatment that he suffered. The journalist refused to pay the damages and interest and to publish a disclaimer. With the risk of criminal prosecution, she sought asylum in a European country at the end of May 2009. She was not only afraid of being deprived of her freedom but also feared for her safety, as she received death threats from an extreme right-wing group. The defender of detainees' rights, Mr. Aleksei Sokolov, President of the organisation "Legal Basis", member of the Non-Governmental Commission of Observation of Places of Detention in the Sverdlovsk region and well-known for his denunciations of the use of torture in Russian prisons, has been the victim of judicial harassment since May 2009. Accused of being a "crook" and of "large scale robbery" (Articles 162 and 158.4 of the Criminal Code), he was placed in provisional detention on May 13, 2009 in Yekaterinburg prison No. 1. On December 23, 2009, the Bogdanovich Court, in a closed hearing, extended his provisional detention until March 9, 2010. The accusations against Mr. Sokolov were based on statements

13 / On February 11, 2010, Ms. Anastasia Denisova was charged with "violation of copyright in the course of her job" as well as with "using harmful computer programmes", an offence liable to a three years' prison sentence and a fine of 200,000 roubles (around 4,970 euros).

14 / An article published in the municipal newsletter dated September 30, 2009 accused her of inciting national discord and hatred because of her writings on the problem of xenophobia in the Krasnodar region and her work to promote Russo-Georgian dialogue.

forcibly obtained from detainees. Examination of the grounds of the case began in January 2010.

Administrative and judicial harassment of human rights organisations

In 2009, President Medvedev confirmed his willingness to carry out reforms aimed at strengthening civil society in the country. A working group responsible for proposing improvements to the Law on Non-Profit Making Organisations was created by presidential decree on May 8, 2009. The reform process should continue into 2010. The first stage consisted of adopting amendments on the registration and checking of NGOs. These amendments came into force on August 1, 2009 and in particular reduce the checks that NGOs must undergo and the number of authorised grounds for refusal to register. Although these reforms are an important step, they are still not enough since they do not guarantee NGOs protection against arbitrary or politically motivated decisions. The second stage was the drafting of a law to support NGOs that have a social character¹⁵, which would encourage work in the social domain, particularly thanks to State funding and tax benefits. As a result, this support would allow the Government to transfer to NGOs part of its responsibilities relating to the social damage caused by the crisis. However, at the end of 2009, this reform had not been implemented yet. The third stage, planned for the beginning of 2010, will consist in codifying legislation on NGOs and removing the contradictions, regulating NGO taxation and cooperation between NGOs and the State, settling the issue of funding NGOs, and changing legislation relating to the activities of foreign NGOs and international organisations on the territory of the Russian Federation. The human rights organisations call for far greater changes to effectively guarantee the conditions of independence of civil society¹⁶.

However, despite the reforms and the declarations of the head of the executive regarding the reinforcement of freedom of association, the latter was constantly hindered in 2009, particularly on the part of the local authorities. Several organisations encountered obstacles in particular during their attempts to register. In Saratov, for example, in violation of the provisions of the new law, the local department of the Ministry of Justice considered the presentation of a certificate signed by the municipality guaranteeing an address was insufficient for registering organisations, stating that NGOs could only obtain premises at auction, so creating an absurd situation, since in order to sign any property contract, organisations must

15/ These changes were promised by President Dmitri Medvedev during his speech to the nation on November 12, 2009, when he promised to modernise the country on a democratic basis.

16/ See HRO Press Release, December 22, 2009.

have prior legal existence¹⁷. Similarly, as from January 1, 2010, Voronej city council planned to triple the rent of the Human Rights House¹⁸, which was additionally in poor condition¹⁹. Furthermore, NGOs were subjected to checks, including the seizure of their archives, and were prosecuted on unsubstantiated grounds. On the night of July 20 to 21, 2009, in the town of Kazan in Tatarstan, the Agora association and the Kazan Human Rights Centre were searched by agents of the Ministry of Internal Affairs Tax Offences Investigation and Intervention Unit. The laptop computers of the Director of the Kazan Human Rights Centre, Mr. Igor Sholokhov, and the organisation's accountant were seized. On August 5, 2009, representatives of the Inter-Regional Federal Tax Service of the Republic of Tatarstan came to the Agora offices to carry out a tax inspection. In September, Agora filed recourse with the General Prosecutor of the Russian Federation to contest the legality of the search. The Regional Prosecutor responsible to the General Prosecutor concluded that the search was illegal. On November 19, 2009, the Bakhitovsky Regional Court also declared that the search was illegal²⁰. Furthermore, on December 18, 2009, the Minister of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Tatarstan cancelled the tax inspection²¹. Similarly, it was only in March that the Memorial Saint Petersburg Research Centre was able to collect the equipment that had been confiscated during the search carried out in December 2008, after a ruling on March 24, 2009 by the Dzerzhinsky District Court of Saint Petersburg²².

Furthermore, this year human rights associations were again affected by the Law Against Extremism²³. Based on an imprecise definition, the provisions give rise to numerous abuses with regard to the representatives of civil society. Political extremism is one of the Government's favourite

17/ See Human Rights Resource Centre.

18/ The Voronej Human Rights House groups together several associations, such as the Voronej branch of Memorial, a consumers' association, the International Human Rights Defence Group, the Free Labour Confederation, the Youth Human Rights Movement and the Voronej Journalists' Club.

19/ See HRO.

20/ According to the court, agents of the Tatarstan Interior Ministry violated bank secrets, filmed defenders without any grounds, and ordered their financial documents to be handed over with no legal grounds.

21/ See HRO.

22/ The association had contested the legality of the search and demanded the return of the confiscated equipment. On January 14, 2009, the Dzerzhinsky District Court considered that the search had been illegal and demanded that the confiscated archives should be returned. On February 24, 2009, at the request of the Public Ministry, the Saint Petersburg Court cancelled this ruling. The Dzerzhinsky District Court, during re-examination of the case, ruled again on March 24, 2009 and considered that the search was illegal in form since the organisation's lawyer had been prevented from being present during the search.

23/ This law extends the definition of extremism to incitation to racial, religious, political and social hatred and modifies the definition of hate crime in the Criminal Code (Article 63).

accusations for silencing defenders. During the summer and the beginning of the autumn of 2009, the Novorossiysk Prosecutor led a long campaign to discredit the Novorossiysk Human Rights Committee in the name of the fight against extremism. On May 21, 2009, the Prosecutor issued a warning to Ms. **Tamara Karasteleva** and her husband, Mr. **Vadim Karestelev**, members of the organisation, for “inadmissible extremist activity” for having enjoined minors to adopt “antisocial behaviour”. The defenders were accused of having incited agitation in schools, meeting school students to invite them to take part in a demonstration against Law 1539-KZ. Yet, although the defenders denounced the law, which plans to fine parents who do not respect the compulsory curfew for minors, in reality they had carried out no such activity in schools. On September 11, 2009, the Prosecutor tried to set in motion judicial proceedings against the organisation for extremism, calling for the latter to be closed down on the grounds of the warnings and for having displayed the slogan “Freedom is not granted, it’s taken” during a demonstration held on April 4, 2009 and considered to be “extremist”. On September 30, 2009, the Otyabrsky District Court of Novorossiysk ruled that the Prosecutor’s complaint was inadmissible.

Urgent Interventions issued by The Observatory in 2009

Names	Violations / Follow-up	Reference	Date of Issuance
Mr. Stanislav Markelov	Murder	Urgent Appeal RUS 001/0109/OBS 010	January 19, 2009
Ms. Galina Kozhevnikova	Death threats	Closed Letter to the authorities	February 13, 2009
Mr. Stanislav Markelov, Ms. Anastasia Baburova, Ms. Galina Kozhevnikova and Mr. Nikolai Girenko	Assassination / Death threats	Press Release	February 18, 2009
Mr. Alexandre Verkhovsky and Ms. Galina Kozhevnikova	Threats / Harassment	Urgent Appeal RUS 002/0209/OBS 033	February 26, 2009
Memorial Saint Petersburg Research Centre	Illegal confiscation of equipment / Judicial proceedings / Harassment	Urgent Appeal RUS 011/1208/OBS 207.1	March 4, 2009
Ms. Elena Maglevannaya	Judicial proceedings	Urgent Appeal RUS 003/0309/OBS 052	March 24, 2009
	Sentencing	Urgent Appeal RUS 003/0309/OBS 052.1	May 18, 2009
Mr. Lev Ponomarev	Attack	Urgent Appeal RUS 004/0409/OBS 057	April 1, 2009
Mr. Aleksei Sokolov	Arbitrary detention / Ill-treatments / Risk of torture / Judicial harassment	Urgent Appeal RUS 005/0509/OBS 080	May 20, 2009

OBSERVATORY FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS DEFENDERS

Names	Violations / Follow-up	Reference	Date of Issuance
		Urgent Appeal RUS 005/0509/OBS 080.1	August 21, 2009
		Urgent Appeal RUS 005/0509/OBS 080.2	October 27, 2009
		Urgent Appeal RUS 005/0509/OBS 080.3	November 20, 2009
Ms. Tamara Karasteleva and Mr. Vadim Karestelev	Judicial and administrative harassment	Urgent Appeal RUS 006/0609/OBS 087	23 June 2009
Ms. Natalia Estemirova	Assassination / Threats	Press Release	July 15, 2009
Memorial Human Rights Centre	Suspension of activities	Press Release	July 22, 2009
Ms. Natalia Estemirova, Mr. Akhmed Guissaev, Mr. Alexander Cherkasov and Mr. Oleg Orlov / Memorial Human Rights Centre	Threats	Press Release	September 24, 2009
Kazan Human Rights Centre and "Agora"	Search / Harassment	Urgent Appeal RUS 007/0809/OBS 113	August 3, 2009
Ms. Zarema Sadulayeva and Mr. Alik (Umar) Dzhabrailov, Mr. Murad Muradov, Ms. Natalia Estemirova	Assassination	Press Release	August 11, 2009
Mr. Oleg Orlov / Memorial Human Rights Centre / Ms. Natalia Estemirova, Mr. Stanislas Markelov, Ms. Anastasia Baburova, Ms. Zarema Sadulayeva, Mr. Alik (Umar) Dzhabrailov	Judicial harassment	Press Release	October 7, 2009
Mr. Oleg Orlov and Ms. Svetlana Gannushkina	Judicial proceedings	Urgent Appeal RUS 006/1109/OBS 164	November 9, 2009
		Press Release / International Judicial Observation Mission Report	December 21, 2009
ETHnICS / Ms. Anastasia Denisova, Mr. Yuriy Ivaschenko	Search and illegal seizure of equipment / Attempted arbitrary arrest	Urgent Appeal RUS 008/1009/OBS 150	October 15, 2009
Ms. Zarema Gaisanova	Enforced disappearance	Urgent Appeal RUS 009/1209/OBS 189	December 15, 2009