Flygtningenævnets baggrundsmateriale

Bilagsnr.:	795
Land:	Libanon
Kilde:	Freedom House
Titel:	Freedom on the net 2023
Udgivet:	4. oktober 2023
Optaget på baggrundsmaterialet:	28. februar 2024

ecoi.net



Freedom House (Author)

Freedom on the Net 2023 - Lebanon

PARTLY FREE

50

/ 100

A Obstacles to Access 9 / 25

B Limits on Content 22 / 35

C Violations of User Rights 19 / 40

LAST YEAR'S SCORE & STATUS

51 / 100 Partly Free

Scores are based on a scale of 0 (least free) to 100 (most free). See the research methodology and <u>report acknowledgements.</u>

Overview

Internet freedom in Lebanon remains tenuous, and the ongoing economic crisis has created major financial obstacles for internet service providers (ISPs) and users alike. A recent crackdown on government criticism resulted in several high-profile online journalists and activists being summoned for investigation by the Cybercrimes Bureau. While few websites are blocked and the online ecosystem is relatively diverse, online users are increasingly self-censoring their political speech. With support from Iran, Hezbollah's "electronic army" continues to launch online disinformation campaigns and frequently harasses those who criticize the group or its policies.

Lebanon's political system ensures representation for its officially recognized religious communities, but limits competition and impedes the rise of cross-communal or civic parties. While residents enjoy some civil liberties and media pluralism, they also suffer from pervasive corruption and major weaknesses in the rule of law. The country's large population of noncitizens, including refugees and migrant workers, remains subject to

legal constraints and societal attitudes that severely restrict their access to employment, freedom of movement, and other fundamental rights.

Key Developments, June 1, 2022 - May 31, 2023

- The ongoing economic crisis negatively impacted telecommunications services and affordability (see A1 and A2).
- Several high-profile journalists and activists were summoned to the Cybercrimes Bureau in retaliation for their online content (see B2 and B3).
- LGBT+ hate speech increased during the coverage period, and several online journalists were subject to violent harassment campaigns, often perpetrated by Hezbollah supporters (see C7).

A Obstacles to Access

A1 0-6 pts

Do infrastructural limitations restrict access to the internet or the 3 / speed and quality of internet connections? 6

Score Change: This score declined from 4 to 3 to correct for an error in one of the sources used to calculate internet speeds, though the ongoing economic crisis continued to undermine access to quality internet service.

Lebanon's telecommunications infrastructure is weak and constrains internet access. The ongoing economic crisis has impacted telecommunications services, and users experienced service disruptions and decreased internet speeds during the reporting period.1

Internet penetration in Lebanon stood at 86.6 percent in January 2023,2 down from 89.3 percent in January 2022.3 Internet speeds slowed during the reporting period.4 In May 2023, the median broadband and mobile download speeds were 8.31 megabits per second (Mbps) and 31.54 Mbps, respectively.5 According to the Inclusive Internet Index for 2022, Lebanon ranks 74th out of 110 countries surveyed on indicators related to internet availability, affordability, relevance, and readiness.6

Lebanon's economic crisis, exacerbated by the collapse of its currency, threatens the viability of the information and communication technology (ICT) sector. Furthermore, rolling electrical blackouts have left people without access to the internet.7 During the coverage period, telecommunications companies struggled to cover the cost of the fuel needed to run and maintain their services,8 which led to increased prices for consumers (see A2).9 Fuel shortages caused several localized service disruptions during the coverage period.10

Employees of OGERO, the country's official telecommunications distributor, went on strike in March 2023 to protest their low salaries,11 disrupting mobile and fixed-line services in various regions. OGERO employees assured costumers that the disruptions were caused by a lack of funding for maintenance and were unrelated to the strike.12 In response, Telecommunications Minister Johnny Corm threatened that the army would take over OGERO's control centers, though it did not do so.13 In May 2023, another OGERO strike resulted in scheduled internet cuts across the country.14

Rural areas are often more affected by electricity blackouts than urban areas. For example, mobile networks are frequently disrupted by power outages in the Bekaa Valley and north Lebanon. In these regions, Syrian mobile networks have taken over "amid the complete absence of Lebanese network coverage." 15 The safety of Syrian networks is questionable due to the ongoing war, and it is impossible to determine whether those who control Syrian mobile networks are collecting user metadata.

In May 2022, the Lebanese government approved two decisions concerning the ICT sector. The first was to raise the price of services (see A2). The second was to shut down the second-generation (2G) network and parts of the third-generation (3G) network.16 Shutting down these networks could leave more than 230,000 subscribers without access to mobile services until they upgrade their devices and will primarily impact rural users. It will also put a strain on the fourth-generation (4G) network, which could decrease the quality of mobile connectivity.17

A2 0-3 pts

Is access to the internet prohibitively expensive or beyond the reach of certain segments of the population for geographical, $\frac{0}{3}$ social, or other reasons?

Score Change: The score declined from 1 to 0 because internet access became prohibitively expensive due to the current economic crisis and crippling corruption in the ICT sector.

Lebanon has expensive communications services, and costs have been exacerbated by the ongoing economic crisis. A significant divide in access exists between rural and urban areas.18 Disruptions are more frequent in rural areas like the Bekaa Valley and north Lebanon, and rural dwellers often only have access to 2G or 3G networks.19

The ongoing economic crisis has impacted people's ability to afford telecommunications services, which have become prohibitively expensive for the nearly 75 percent of people living on less than \$14 a day as of the end of 2022.20 According to Cable, a telecommunications company, Lebanon ranked 169th out of 233 countries and territories for mobile data

pricing in 2022.21 One gigabyte (GB) of mobile data cost \$3, while the average monthly fixed-line broadband package cost \$18.53 in 2022.22

Internet subscription prices are set by the government, and ISPs cannot lower prices unless a decree is issued by the Ministry of Telecommunications.23 In May 2022, the government announced that it would be raising telecommunications prices, basing them on the Sayrafa currency exchange rate.24 This quadrupled the price of mobile data, making it inaccessible to many users.25 In January 2023, after the Sayrafa exchange rate was set, the price of a basic 1.5 GB mobile phone plan nearly tripled, and by March it cost users 530,000 Lebanese pounds (\$35.33).26 Also in March, the Ministry of Telecommunications and Prime Minister Najib Mikati pushed for an even larger price increase.27 With no clear plan to restructure the sector or tackle corruption, the financial burden is left on the user.28

The crisis has also affected residents' ability to access electricity, and frequent power cuts leave people in some areas with only three or four hours of electricity per day (see A1).29 The crisis has particularly impacted at-risk communities such as people living under the poverty line, LGBT+ individuals, and migrants.30

A3 0-6 pts

Does the government exercise technical or legal control over internet infrastructure for the purposes of restricting connectivity?

While the government has periodically restricted mobile and internet connectivity in past years, and the Telecommunications Law provides the government with the authority to order internet shutdowns, no restrictions were reported during the coverage period.31

The government maintains a monopoly over the internet backbone and over fixed-line and mobile telephone service, and exercises tight control over ISPs. Lebanon has three international border gateways—in Tripoli, Jdeideh, and Beirut—where underwater fiber-optic cables connect the country via the India–Middle East–Western Europe (I-ME-WE), Cadmos, and Berytar cables, respectively.32 The gateways are all operated by OGERO and all ISPs purchase services through OGERO.

Voice over Internet Protocol (VoIP) services are technically restricted under the 2002 Telecommunications Law,33 but this ban has only been sporadically enforced.34 OGERO installed equipment to block VoIP services in 2010 and used it on a handful of occasions to block the Vonage VoIP service, though not Skype or WhatsApp. However, OGERO stopped blocking Vonage after pressure from businesses, civil society, and politicians.35

Are there legal, regulatory, or economic obstacles that restrict 1 / the diversity of service providers?

The telecommunications industry is government-owned and tightly regulated.36

The fixed-line telephone and internet network is owned and operated by OGERO, from which all companies must purchase services. In addition to running the internet backbone, OGERO sets internet prices and collectively manages online subscriptions of private ISPs, including Cyberia, Terranet, Sodetel, and IDM.37

As of 2023, there were 185 privately owned ISPs.38 ISPs currently obtain a permit by decree from the Ministry of Telecommunications,39 and political influence can affect the allocation of contracts to private ISPs and mobile service providers.40 The currency collapse has exacerbated financial issues within the ICT sector.

The functionally government has controlled the mobile telecommunications sector since October 2020. Previously, the two government-owned mobile service providers, Alfa and Touch, were provisionally managed by private companies Orascom Telecom Lebanon and Zain, respectively.41 In early September 2020, the management contracts for the two companies were not renewed by the government. Later that month, Orascom announced that it had transferred management of Alfa to the Ministry of Telecommunications. In October 2020, Zain followed suit. As of May 2022, both Alfa and Touch were owned by the state, and no tender was launched during the reporting period.42

In March 2022, Alfa and Touch converted their subscribers' balances from US dollars to Lebanese pounds.43 This was part of a larger strategy to eventually increase prices (see A2). While customers were alerted of this change, the conversion led subscribers to lose most of their balance's value due to the difference between the official exchange rate and the rate set via Sayrafa.44

In January 2023, Nabil Bukhalid, the founder and manager of the .lb domain, died, leading the Internet Society's Lebanon chapter to reassure users that the system governing the .lb domain would remain functional. Since 2020, Bukhalid ran the .lb domain at his own expense.45 The initial plan was to transfer the administration of the .gov.lb domain to the Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform, although as of June 2023 this transfer had not occurred.46

A5 0-4 pts

Do national regulatory bodies that oversee service providers and digital technology fail to operate in a free, fair, and independent manner?

Lebanese media and telecommunications laws are regulated by three semi-independent advisory bodies that report to the Council of Ministers. The National Council for Audiovisual Media and the Committee for Establishing Model Bylaws and Practices deal mainly with audiovisual media (television, radio, and satellite), while the Telecommunications Regulatory Authority (TRA) is responsible for liberalizing, regulating, and developing the ICT sector.47 Overall, the three bodies have limited power and are not considered particularly robust or independent regulators, making the Ministry of Telecommunications the de facto regulator.

The TRA is nominally independent, but in practice, influential political groups hold sway over the institution, often rendering it ineffective.48 Former telecommunications ministers have claimed that the TRA has no real authority, given that the law establishing its powers has not yet been implemented.49 Since its launch in 2007, many of the TRA's objectives have not been met, including the analog-to-digital transition and the privatization of the ICT sector.

B Limits on Content

B1 0-6 pts

Does the state block or filter, or compel service providers to block or filter, internet content, particularly material that is protected by international human rights standards?

In recent years, the state has started to block more content, often related to gambling, pornography, and Israel, and has not been transparent about its decisions.

The popular LGBT+ dating platform Grindr, which was originally blocked on Alfa and Touch in 2019, remained inaccessible during the coverage period.50 Israel-based web-hosting platform Wix has been inaccessible on mobile networks and some ISPs since December 2018 based on a judicial order citing the Israel Boycott Law. Users were not given any advance notice of the blocking.51

In May 2023, the Union of Public Transport Drivers went on strike and demanded that unregistered rideshare applications, like Bolt, be banned.52 In response, the Ministry of Interior and Municipalities addressed a letter to the Ministry of Telecommunications requesting that Bolt be blocked.53 However, the request was denied because it lacked a judicial order.

In May 2020, the prosecutor general ordered the Ministry of Telecommunications to block 28 applications, alleging that they were spreading misinformation about the unofficial exchange rate between the Lebanese pound and the US dollar. While the ministry was implementing the block, they also blocked Google's Firebase service, which many

developers and entrepreneurs rely on to build applications.54 In March 2021, OGERO was asked by the judiciary to block all online platforms offering unofficial currency exchanges. Several other ISPs followed suit, blocking applications and websites that did not reflect the government-approved exchange rate.55 It is unclear if these apps remained blocked at the end of the coverage period.

YouTube, Facebook, Twitter, and international blog-hosting services are freely available.

B2 0-4 pts

Do state or nonstate actors employ legal, administrative, or other means to force publishers, content hosts, or digital platforms to 2 / delete content, particularly material that is protected by 4 international human rights standards?

Government security officials pressure individuals to remove posts—mainly those criticizing government officials or the army—from social media pages, blogs, and websites. At times the government makes requests to social media platforms to remove content.

Individuals are frequently summoned to appear before the Cybercrimes Bureau and asked to sign a pledge and delete their social media posts. This practice increased during the coverage period, and several highprofile journalists and activists were summoned by the Cybercrimes Bureau. In April 2023, Jean Kassir, the cofounder of Megaphone, and Lara Bitar, the editor in chief of Public Source, were summoned for interrogation and presumably asked to take down online articles that were critical of government officials or policies.56 Kassir, who was summoned twice in connection with an article that criticized the public prosecutor, refused to appear and the complaint against him was ultimately withdrawn.57 Bitar was summoned after publishing an article that discussed environmental crimes committed by the Lebanese Forces, a militia group active during the 1975–90 civil war.58 Bitar also refused to appear.59

In April 2023, Nizar Saghieh, a lawyer and cofounder of the nongovernmental organization (NGO) Legal Agenda, was summoned to a hearing by the Beirut Bar Association (BBA).60 The summons followed Saghieh's online criticism of the BBA's amended code of ethics.61 In June 2023, after the coverage period, Hayat Mirshad, the cofounder and executive director of feminist organization Fe-Male and the editor in chief of feminist online platform Sharika wa Laken, was summoned by the Beirut Court of Appeals after she was sued for defamation by actor and director Joe Kodeih (see C3).62 Although neither Saghieh nor Mirshad appeared at their respective hearings, they were presumably asked to remove the content in question.

In June 2022, Ghassan Rifi, the editor in chief of the Safir al-Shamal news site, was summoned after publishing an article questioning the relationship between a former political candidate in Lebanon and the Israeli government.63 A political analyst, Nidal al-Sabaa, was summoned by the Central Criminal Investigation Office in September 2022 for Twitter posts about former prime minister Saad Hariri.64 All were presumably asked to sign a pledge and remove the content in question.

B3 0-4 pts

Do restrictions on the internet and digital content lack transparency, proportionality to the stated aims, or an 4 independent appeals process?

Government decisions to restrict platforms have not always been fully transparent.

Article 125 of the 2018 Electronic Transactions and Personal Data Law allows the court to order "the suspension of certain electronic services" and to "block certain websites or cancel accounts on such websites" linked to crimes including terrorism, child pornography, gambling, fraud, money laundering, and "crimes against internal and external security." Article 126 gives the public prosecutor the power to suspend services and accounts and block websites for up to 30 days (see C5).65

Generally, websites are blocked through court orders: The court receives a complaint and files it with the Cybercrimes Bureau for further investigation, later issuing a final order to the Ministry of Telecommunications, which then blocks the websites through OGERO. Website owners are not notified that their websites have been blocked, but must appeal the blocking within 48 hours in order to have the decision overturned. Grindr was first blocked in January 2019 without a court order (see B1).

Blocking orders are generally rooted in law. Escort service websites, for example, have been blocked in accordance with Articles 523 and 524 of the penal code. Israeli sites have been blocked in accordance with Decree 12562, issued in 1963, which called for the boycotting of Israel, while gambling websites were blocked in accordance with Law 417 of 1995, which gives the Casino du Liban a monopoly on gambling activity within the country. However, some past website blockings have been criticized for the seemingly haphazard manner in which the blocking orders were issued. 66

In November 2022, the Ministry of Information published a draft media law on its website, though the law has yet to be passed in the parliament.67 Despite promises from lawmakers, civil society has not yet been involved in the drafting process.68 While the draft prohibits pretrial detention for crimes related to publishing online, including on social media, it contains provisions that criminalize defamation.69 In April 2023,

a new draft was made public by the ministry and UN Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).70

In May 2023, US authorities sanctioned and took down 13 Hezbollah-related web domains after Hezbollah was listed as a terrorist organization by the United States. The removed domains included the website of Al Manar TV—which has ties to Hezbollah—as well as online charities affiliated with the Martyrs' Foundation in Lebanon and the Emdad Committee for Islamic Charity. Al Manar's Lebanese domain (.lb) is still accessible.71

B4 0-4 pts

Do online journalists, commentators, and ordinary users practice 2 / self-censorship? 4

Self-censorship is common in the blogosphere and at top media outlets, which are owned by powerful figures from all sides of the political spectrum. Users often fear repercussions from the government or certain political and sectarian groups, including defamation lawsuits, if they post controversial content.

Recent crackdowns on online journalism have increased self-censorship among members of the media (see C3).72 Furthermore, the proliferation of anti-LGBT+ hate speech online has led to increased self-censorship within this community, particularly by previously outspoken activists (see C7).73

There has also been increasing self-censorship among lawyers and judges due to recent amendments to the BBA's code of ethics that prevents lawyers and judges from speaking publicly in the media without a prior authorization from the BBA president (see B2).74

B5 0-4 pts

Are online sources of information controlled or manipulated by the government or other powerful actors to advance a particular political interest?

Lebanese media is highly partisan and controlled by the dominant politico-sectarian actors, reflecting Lebanon's political fragmentation. In December 2018, the Samir Kassir Foundation and Reporters Without Borders (RSF) released the Media Ownership Monitor, which found that "the top news websites in Lebanon belong to, or mirror, the same political parties that own the country's traditional media. The same political agendas reflected in traditional media also exist online."75

Elite families directly involved in politics own several prominent media outlets.76 For example, Parliament speaker Nabih Berri partially owns the National Broadcasting Network (NBN) and its affiliates, while Hezbollah controls a vast network of media outlets. Prominent political figures choose the heads of these outlets, and their news content often advances

a particular partisan message. Politicians are also known to attempt to bribe the few independent news outlets and journalists that do exist, particularly during election periods.77

Hezbollah is able to manipulate online narratives through content on the websites it owns, which number over 20, as well as through its social media presence, where it disseminates propaganda both within Lebanon and abroad. In October 2022, its social networks shared Hezbollah leader Hassan Nasrallah's rhetoric that the death of Mahsa Amini in Iran was a "vague incident" and his attempts to downplay the resulting protests in Iran.78

Online disinformation was prevalent ahead of the May 2022 elections. According to a Maharat Foundation survey of social media content ahead of the elections, 49.5 percent of content analyzed included political and sectarian propaganda from political actors (see B8).79 Specifically, Hezbollah's "electronic army" flagged comments and spammed articles deemed critical of the group and its leaders, at times resulting in the content being removed.80

The armed wing of Hezbollah continues to spread disinformation and propaganda online, targeting both Lebanese and international audiences.81 An investigation by the *Telegraph*, which it reported on in 2020, found that the network, which receives support from Iran, orchestrates defamation campaigns against opponents of Hezbollah and teaches its members how create inauthentic social media profiles, doctor pictures, spread propaganda, and avoid censorship by social media companies.82 The network has also been responsible for a number of cyberattacks across the region (see C8).83

B6 0-3 pts

Are there economic or regulatory constraints that negatively 2 / affect users' ability to publish content online?

Independent digital media outlets struggle to achieve sustainability due to Lebanon's relatively weak digital advertising market, as most advertising revenue is absorbed by television and other traditional media. Obstacles to boosting the digital advertising market include Lebanon's slow and unreliable internet services and the ongoing economic crisis.84

Under the Press Law, it is "forbidden to issue a press publication without first obtaining a license." Obtaining a license is difficult and expensive in practice, however.85

Outlets with formal or informal ties to politicians or powerful figures are financially more viable than those without connections.86

B7 0-4 pts

Does the online information landscape lack diversity and 3 / reliability?

Lebanese users have access to a variety of local and international news and media. While relatively pluralistic, the media landscape is dominated by the agendas of powerful politico-sectarian leaders and their allies, often overshadowing the voices of minority groups (see B5).87 However, several new independent online media outlets launched after widespread protests took place beginning in October 2019.

Despite evidence of some filtering, taboo subjects that would normally be banned from mainstream media outlets, such as pornography, content supportive of Israel, and sectarian hate speech, are generally available online. Because Article 534 of the penal code has been used to prosecute LGBT+ individuals, content about the LGBT+ community operates in a legal gray zone and has been subject to censorship (see B1).

Channels and accounts dedicated to sexual health awareness have been blocked or restricted on social media, sparking controversy about sex education online and offline (see B2).88 A popular drag performer's Instagram account was banned and later restored following a campaign to support the account owner. Individuals and groups advocating for LGBT+ rights practice self-censorship at times so as not to lose their social media accounts (see B4).89

Social media is popular in Lebanon, and many news outlets have created dedicated social media pages to reach broader audiences.90 In 2021, the launch of the audio-only social media app Clubhouse allowed online users in Lebanon to debate and discuss social, political, and economic reforms in the country—topics that are rarely covered transparently in traditional media.91 However, some users have reported that they were targeted with harassment—including death threats—on the app for sharing anti-Hezbollah views (see C7).92

The economic crisis has led to the closure of several prominent outlets, limiting the diversity of online content. For example, the *Daily Star* stopped its traditional and online operations in 2021.93

B8 0-6 pts

Do conditions impede users' ability to mobilize, form communities, and campaign, particularly on political and social issues?

In recent years, NGOs and individual actors have used the internet as a primary or secondary tool to extend the reach of their national awareness-raising campaigns.

In 2022, social media played an important role for political discussion and mobilization ahead of Lebanon's parliamentary elections. According to a Maharat Foundation survey of social media content ahead of the elections, 43 percent of 100 surveyed female candidates were subject to online harassment (see C7).94

State actors have also been limiting lawyers and judges' freedom of expression online. The recent amendment to BBA's code of ethics prevents lawyers from speaking publicly in the media without a prior authorization from the BBA president.95

In 2020, Lebanese people took to social media to campaign and mobilize around a number of causes, most notably following the Beirut port explosion. After the explosion—and the revelation of government corruption and mismanagement that led to it—the hashtag عقوا _المشانق ("hang the nooses") was used to demand accountability from Lebanon's ruling parties.96 However, as online mobilization turned to in-person protests, authorities reportedly monitored online spaces, such as social networking sites and messaging services, to limit antigovernment demonstrations.97

C Violations of User Rights

C1 0-6 pts

Do the constitution or other laws fail to protect rights such as freedom of expression, access to information, and press freedom, 2 / including on the internet, and are they enforced by a judiciary 6 that lacks independence?

The constitution guarantees freedom of expression, freedom of assembly, and freedom of the press. However, articles in the penal code and the military code of justice place restrictions on freedom of expression (see C2). The judiciary also lacks independence, as it is subject to considerable political influence.98

Other issues persist. While Lebanon passed a law on the right to access information in 2017,99 state agencies rarely comply. For example, when the Gherbal Initiative, a Lebanese NGO, sent access-to-information requests to 133 administrations, they received just 34 responses.100

In August 2020, after the Beirut port explosion, the Lebanese parliament approved a two-week state of emergency.101 The designation afforded the government broad powers, including the ability to set curfews, ban gatherings, and censor publications that threaten national security.102

C2 0-4 pts

Are there laws that assign criminal penalties or civil liability for online activities, particularly those that are protected under 4 international human rights standards?

The Lebanese penal code prohibits defamation of the president, public officials, and the army. Article 157 of the military code of justice also

In 2016, the Court of Cassation ended the debate over which law regulates speech promulgated on social media in Lebanon, opting to place it under the jurisdiction of the penal code instead of the Publications Law.104 Because the Publications Law does not explicitly refer to electronic publishing and websites, there is some confusion about what forms of online speech are subject to restriction under the law. The Publications Court has considered journalists' social media posts to fall under its jurisdiction, even as other courts and nonjudicial bodies have prosecuted journalists for articles they had written. However, the Publications Court decided that other social media posts are not subject to the regulations relating to the Publications Law, but rather to the penal code, which contains fewer protections for individuals.105

The authorities prosecute legitimate online speech using Article 317, which penalizes those who incite sectarianism or racial strife; Articles 383 to 387, which criminalize the defamation of public officials and the insulting of national emblems; and Articles 473 and 474, which concern blasphemy and religious rituals.

During the coverage period, the head of the BBA called on the criminal courts to investigate cases of defamation, libel, slander, insults, and purportedly false news (see C3). He also announced the formation of a media committee in the BBA tasked with examining draft laws for current developments and technologies.106

C3 0-6 pts

Are individuals penalized for online activities, particularly those 3 / that are protected under international human rights standards? 6

A significant crackdown on online freedom of expression began in late 2017 and intensified during the coverage period.107

Authorities used criminal defamation laws to silence government criticism during the coverage period and the public prosecutor ordered security forces to detain internet users, in violation of the current Publications Law (see C2).108 In July 2022, an officer in the General Directorate of the Internal Security Forces, Michel Motran, criticized the traffic control office in a Facebook post and was summoned by the Information Division of the Internal Security Forces and held in jail for 10 days.109

High-profile activists and journalists are frequently summoned to the Cybercrimes Bureau in retaliation for their online content. In April 2023, Jean Kassir, the cofounder of Megaphone, and Lara Bitar, the editor in chief of Public Source, were summoned for interrogation, although both refused to appear.110 Both Kassir and Bitar were summoned over recent articles they published that were deemed critical of government agencies or policies (see B2).111

In April 2023, lawyer Nizar Saghieh was summoned to a hearing by the BBA following his criticism of the amendment to organization's code of ethics.112 In June 2023, after the coverage period, Hayat Mirshad, the editor in chief of Sharika wa Laken, was summoned by the Beirut Court of Appeals after the online platform campaigned to boycott a play by Joe Kodeih, who has been accused of harassment by multiple women and girls (see B2).113

In November 2021, Radwan Mortada, a journalist working for *Al-Akhbar*, was sentenced to a year in prison in absentia by a Beirut military court. Mortada was charged with "defamation against the military institution" after criticizing the Lebanese military in his reporting for *Al-Akhbar*.114

C4 0-4 pts

Does the government place restrictions on anonymous 3 / communication or encryption?

The government requires registration for prepaid SIM cards and has considered introducing biometric registration.115

The Ministry of Telecommunications requires individuals to register their International Mobile Equipment Identity (IMEI) number, which corresponds to their phone number, on an unsecure government website.116 In December 2017, the Ministry of Telecommunications proposed the introduction of biometric SIM cards, which would force every person who purchases a SIM card to provide biometric information.117

In May 2023, SMEX reported that mobile service provider Touch was enforcing a strict policy regarding identification documents needed to buy a new SIM card. According to the policy, purchasing a SIM card will require a valid ID, a residential address, and a photo of the customer taken at the site of sale. This policy limits nonresidents, such as Lebanon's many refugees, from purchasing SIM cards.118

C5 0-6 pts

Does state surveillance of internet activities infringe on users' 3 / right to privacy? 6

Score Change: The score improved from 2 to 3 because although authorities likely have the ability to conduct mass online surveillance, there have been no reported cases in recent years.

Digital surveillance in Lebanon is facilitated by the weak legal framework on digital privacy, and a legal framework that gives the government a wide mandate to conduct surveillance.119

Article 14 of the constitution "ensures the inviolability of the home," but it is unclear if this law applies to private communications.120 The

Telecommunications Interception Act of 1999 nominally protects the secrecy of communications, but it has limitations and does not mention modern forms of electronic communication. Moreover, the law gives the government the right to monitor communications if a judge grants government agencies access, or if the Ministry of Interior or Ministry of Defense submits a request to the prime minister for matters related to "combating terrorism, state security, or crimes related to state security."121

Lebanese authorities are believed to have access to spyware. In a 2018 report by Citizen Lab, a Canadian internet watchdog, Lebanon is listed as one of 45 countries worldwide in which devices were likely breached by Pegasus, a targeted spyware software developed by the NSO Group, an Israeli technology firm.122 In 2021, reporting by the *Washington Post* found that Pegasus spyware was used to target and spy on politicians, journalists, and influencers in Lebanon, most notably former prime minister Saad Hariri and Lama Fakih, a journalist working on the Beirut port explosion investigation.123

In February 2020, *Al-Akhbar* revealed that mobile service provider Alfa purchased deep packet inspection (DPI) software from Sandvine in 2015 and used the technology to share information with security agencies. Additionally, Alfa spent \$3 million on a newer DPI system, produced by NEXIUS, in 2018, but that system is still not functional.124

In January 2018, the Electronic Frontier Foundation (EFF) and mobile-security firm Lookout reported that a surveillance operation called Dark Caracal operated out of a General Directorate for General Security (GDGS) building in Beirut, targeting military personnel, government officials, activists, journalists, and lawyers in 21 countries.125 The operation relied on a unique mobile surveillance tool, dubbed Pallas, which was able to extract hundreds of gigabytes of data from Android devices and desktop devices. Using spear-phishing tactics, Dark Caracal sent malware-laden Facebook and WhatsApp URLs to users that allowed attackers to extract messages and phone calls, download applications, monitor calls, and upload files onto Android devices.

Security agencies have also used surveillance technologies such as FinFisher and International Mobile Subscriber Identity (IMSI) catchers.126 WikiLeaks exposed the government's use of FinFisher, which is sold exclusively to law enforcement agencies and allows them to exploit system updates on targets' computers.

During protests in 2019, Internal Security Forces (ISF) officers infiltrated protesters' WhatsApp groups and made arrests based on information shared in these groups.127 There were also reports of security agencies confiscating detainees' phones for unusually long periods of time.

Technical analyses revealed attempts at surveillance and unlawful searches during the reporting period.128

Authorities have increasingly employed biometric technologies. The GDGS adopted biometric passports in 2016,129 and a year later, the government announced that it would begin issuing biometric residence permits to foreigners (see C4).130 Additionally, intelligence agencies have links to different politicians or parties, and in turn their own agendas, which has led to privacy violations. Without a strong data protection law, it is unclear if biometric data could be used to increase surveillance (see C6).131

C6 0-6 pts

Does monitoring and collection of user data by service providers and other technology companies infringe on users' right to privacy?

Lebanon does not have comprehensive data protection laws and the government's ownership and control over ISPs could facilitate unlawful data collection (see A4).

The Electronic Transactions and Personal Data Law, which was passed in October 2018, fails to provide adequate safeguards to protect user data and privacy. The law designates the Ministry of Economy and Trade as Lebanon's data protection authority. While the law includes certain provisions around data rights, transparency requirements, data retention limitations, and security measures, it fails to adequately protect user data due to vague language, inadequate safeguards for user data, and the lack of an independent oversight authority.132 Article 97 gives the defense, interior, health, and justice ministers the authority to license data related to state security, court proceedings, and health, placing even more power in the executive branch. Moreover, the law only mentions the instances where a license is not required, rather than clearly outlining all the instances in which entities must obtain a license. Additionally, it does not define a number of key terms, such as "consent," and fails to place limits on data storage.133

In May 2023, SMEX executive director Mohamad Najem claimed that the government was pressuring the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) to provide all the data it has on refugees in Lebanon, including biometric data.134 As of June 2023, the government and UNHCR have not reached an agreement on this request.

At times the government requests user account information from major social media companies.135 In recent years, the cabinet has passed motions giving the security agencies temporary but unhindered access to all telecommunications metadata (see C5). Alfa and Touch are compelled to comply because they are owned by the government.

In October 2021, the prime minister formed a committee of ministries to investigate the possibility of "granting security agencies and armed forces full access to all telecommunication data." The reason behind this potential move remains unclear, however activists raised the alarm at the possibility of security agencies accessing this data given the GDGS's history of surveillance through operation Dark Caracal (see C5).136

C7 0-5 pts

Are individuals subject to extralegal intimidation or physical violence by state authorities or any other actor in relation to their 5 online activities?

Journalists and ordinary citizens sometimes face intimidation for their online comments. Political parties and armed groups have been known to target their critics through online harassment campaigns, which have at times led to offline attacks.137

High-profile journalists and activists have been victims of harassment, which at times escalates to physical violence, in retaliation for their online content. In August 2022, freelance online photojournalist Hasan Chaaban was physically harassed by Hezbollah supporters in retaliation for his coverage of the Beit Yahoun protests, which included reporting that criticized the Hezbollah-aligned Amal Movement and Hezbollah. Chaaban received death threats and a bullet was left on his car window, reportedly as a threat to leave Beit Yahoun.138 Also in August, journalist Dima Sadek was subject to harassment campaigns orchestrated by Hezbollah supporters, which included death threats, rape threats, and violent online harassment. Sadek was most recently targeted after posting a social media post in support of Salman Rushdie and his controversial book, *The Satanic Verses*.139

Another online defamation campaign on social media was launched against the judge assigned to investigate the Beirut port explosion. Supporters of Hezbollah and the Amal Movement orchestrated a smear campaign to "electronically assassinate" judge Tarek Bitar after he summoned and accused two Hezbollah politicians of being involved in the blast.140

Ordinary social media users, particularly women and LGBT+ individuals, have experienced online harassment and doxing.141 For example, Dalia Ahmad, a journalist for independent television station Al Jadeed, received racist threats from online trolls after she criticized Lebanese political leaders, including Hezbollah's Hassan Nasrallah.142

During the coverage period, a right-wing Christian group called the "Soldiers of God"143 spread hate messages online targeting the LGBT+ community, specifically through their YouTube channel. The group was initially formed in 2020, although its ideology has gained followers in recent years. In its online campaigns, the group praises conversion

therapy and advocates for the mass murder of LGBT+ individuals. Their influence, both online and offline, led Internal Security Minister Bassam Mawlawi to issue an order banning all LGBT+ public gatherings.144

While not common, physical violence over online content has occurred in the past. In February 2021, political activist and publisher Lokman Slim was assassinated, allegedly for his political views and critiques of Lebanese political parties and militias. Slim was a prominent Hezbollah critic and received death threats from the group in 2019, although no group took responsibility for his murder.145 He was active on social media and was frequently quoted and interviewed by online news outlets.146

C8 0-3 pts

Are websites, governmental and private entities, service providers, or individual users subject to widespread hacking and 3 other forms of cyberattack?

Cybersecurity breaches, cyberwarfare, and criminal hacks have been worrying trends in recent years.

In November 2022, the user data of over 1.8 million Lebanese WhatsApp users was leaked and sold on the dark web.147 Microsoft detected malicious activity originating from the Lebanon-based group Polonium, and their activity was reportedly coordinated with actors from Iran's Ministry of Intelligence and Security.148

In recent years, the Quds Force of Iran's Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps has provided Hezbollah with sophisticated cyberattack technology. Hezbollah's "electronic army" has gathered intelligence on Lebanese government institutions and has orchestrated cyberattacks against financial institutions in Lebanon and abroad.149 In 2021, a group of hackers linked to Hezbollah breached 250 servers in different countries, including Lebanon, and stole sensitive data. According to cybersecurity reports, the hackers relied on a custom, remote-access virus, and their victims included individuals, companies, and institutions.150

Suspected Iranian hackers targeted Lebanese internet users through a variety of malware attacks. In one case, the attackers sent information about job opportunities that would deploy malware once the user clicked the infected link.151 While it is unclear who the specific targets of this attack were, it is suspected that the Iranian hacking group was targeting financial, energy, telecommunications, and government institutions.

A committee of ministry, military, intelligence, and private-sector representatives was established in November 2018 and tasked with presenting recommendations to the parliament on establishing a national cybersecurity agency.152 In 2019, a committee was formed to handle the implementation of the cybersecurity strategy until the creation of the

National Cybersecurity Committee, which has not yet been established.153

Footnotes

- 1"Energy crisis in Lebanon leads to widening telecoms blackouts,"
 NetBlocks, January 15, 2022, https://netblocks.org/reports/energy-crisis-in-lebanon-leads-to-widenin...
- 2Simon Kemp, "Digital 2023: Lebanon," Data Reportal, February 15, 2023, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2023-lebanon
- 3Simon Kemp, "Digital 2022: Lebanon," Data Reportal, February 15, 2022, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2022-lebanon
- 4"Energy crisis in Lebanon leads to widening telecoms blackouts," NetBlocks, January 15, 2022, https://netblocks.org/reports/energy-crisis-in-lebanon-leads-to-widenin...
- 5"Lebanon," Speedtest Global, Accessed August 2023, https://www.speedtest.net/global-index/lebanon
- 6The Inclusive Internet Index, "Lebanon," accessed July 2022, https://theinclusiveinternet.eiu.com/explore/countries/LB/
- 7"Energy crisis in Lebanon leads to widening telecoms blackouts," NetBlocks, January 15, 2022, https://netblocks.org/reports/energy-crisis-in-lebanon-leads-to-widenin...
- 8Generator fuel amounts for seven percent of the telecom sector's expenses. "Lebanon faces Internet service interruption amid fuel crisis,"
 Arab
 News,
 January
 2022, https://www.arabnews.com/node/2005386/middle-east
- 9Abed Kataya, "Disastrous 'Solutions' To Save Lebanon's Telecom Sector," May 23, 2022, https://smex.org/disastrous-solutions-to-save-lebanons-telecom-sector/
- 10@Orego_Telecom, Twitter post, Twitter, July 1, 2023,https://twitter.com/OgeroTelecom/status/166417619918099251 2?s=20; @Kataya_Abd, "Praise be to God, a list of exchanges that will be shut down successively was leaked, coinciding with the strike by Ogero employees," Twitter, May 31, 2023, https://twitter.com/kataya_abd/status/1663979389288079360? t=DsxwUga7Spp...
- 11Abdul Qataya, "Is the Lebanese Government Deliberately Pushing the Telecom Sector to Collapse?," SMEX, March 31, 2023, https://smex.org/ar/%d8%a7%d9%84%d8%ad%d9%83%d9%88%d9%85%d8%a9-%d8%a7%d...
- 12"Telecoms Minister Suggests Lebanese Army Could Take Over Orgero," L'Oriente Jour, May 31, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333179/telecomsminister-sugge...

- 13"Telecoms Minister Suggests Lebanese Army Could Take Over Orgero," L'Oriente Jour, May 31, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333179/telecomsminister-sugge...
- 14@Kataya_Abd, "Praise be to God, a list of exchanges that will be shut down successively was leaked, coinciding with the strike by Ogero employees," Twitter, May 31, 2023, https://twitter.com/kataya_abd/status/1663979389288079360? t=DsxwUga7Spp...
- 15Abed Kataya, "Mobile Services At The Lebanese-Syrian Border: Outages And Clashing Networks," SMEX, January 12, 2022, https://smex.org/mobile-services-at-the-lebanese-syrian-border-outages-...
- 16Abed Kataya, "Disastrous solutions to save Lebanon's telecom sector," SMEX, May 23, 2022, https://smex.org/disastrous-solutionsto-save-lebanons-telecom-sector/
- 17Ragheb Ghandour, "Let them eat 4G!," SMEX, June 3, 2022, https://smex.org/let-them-eat-4g/
- 18"SMEX: Remote learning and the digital divide in Lebanon," APC, October 27, 2020, https://www.apc.org/en/news/smex-remote-learning-and-digital-divide-leb...
- 19Ragheb Ghandour, "Let them eat 4G!," SMEX, June 3, 2022, https://smex.org/let-them-eat-4g/
- 20"Lebanon's Rising Poverty and Hunger Amid Economic Crisis," Human Rights Watch, December 12. 2022, https://www.hrw.org/news/2022/12/12/lebanon-rising-poverty-hunger-amid-...
- 21Cable, "Worldwide mobile data pricing: The cost of 1GB of mobile data in 233 countries," July 26, 2022, https://www.cable.co.uk/mobiles/worldwide-data-pricing/
- 22Cable, "Worldwide mobile data pricing: The cost of 1GB of mobile data in 233 countries," July 26, 2022, https://www.cable.co.uk/mobiles/worldwide-data-pricing/
- 23Livia Murray, "Four reasons Lebanon's internet is so slow," Executive Magazine, April 8, 2015, https://www.executive-magazine.com/economics-policy/four-reasons-lebano...
- 24"Lebanon telecoms markup threatens migrants," Reuters, July 11, 2022, https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/lebanon-telecoms-mark-up-thre...
- 25Abed Kataya, "Disastrous solutions to save Lebanon's telecom sector," SMEX, May 23, 2022, https://smex.org/disastrous-solutionsto-save-lebanons-telecom-sector/

- 26Kataya Abd, "The Rise in the Prices of Mobile Communications in Lebanon in Parallel with the Rise in the Exchange Rate of the Dollar," SMEX, March 3, 2023, https://smex.org/ar/%d8%a3%d8%b3%d8%b9%d8%a7%d8%b1-%d8%a7%d8%aa%d8%b5%d...
- 27Kataya Abd, "The Rise in the Prices of Mobile Communications in Lebanon in Parallel with the Rise in the Exchange Rate of the Dollar," SMEX, March 3, 2023, https://smex.org/ar/%d8%a3%d8%b3%d8%b9%d8%a7%d8%b1 -%d8%a7%d8%aa%d8%b5%d...
- 28Kataya Abd, "The Rise in the Prices of Mobile Communications in Lebanon in Parallel with the Rise in the Exchange Rate of the Dollar," SMEX, March 3, 2023, https://smex.org/ar/%d8%a3%d8%b3%d8%b9%d8%a7%d8%b1 -%d8%a7%d8%aa%d8%b5%d...
- 29Timour Azhari and Laila Bassam, "Lebanon draft electricity reform plan sees tariff hike, 24-hour power by 2026," Reuters, February 18, 2022, https://www.reuters.com/article/lebanon-crisis-electricityidINL1N2UT0SY
- 30Maya Gebeily, "Lebanon telecoms mark-up threatens migrants' link to jobs and safety", Reuters, July 11, 2022, https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/lebanontelecoms-mark-up-thre...
- 31" حریة الانترنت في لبنان "Internet freedom in Lebanon]," Maharat Foundation, May 3, 2018, http://www.maharatfoundation.org/internetfreedom
- 32Livia Murray, "Four reasons Lebanon's internet is so slow," Executive Magazine, April 8, 2015, https://www.executive-magazine.com/economics-policy/four-reasons-lebano...
- 33Imad Atalla, "Lebanon is stifling your digital freedom," The Daily Star, June 8, 2010, http://www.dailystar.com.lb/Opinion/Commentary/2010/Jun-08/120557-leban...
- 34"Telecoms 2013 Progress Report," Tayyar, January 3, 2014, http://www.tra.gov.lb/Library/Files/Uploaded%20files/Law431/Law-431-EN...
- 35"Telecoms 2013 Progress Report," Tayyar, January 3, 2014, http://www.tra.gov.lb/Library/Files/Uploaded%20files/Law431/Law-431-EN...
- 36"Telecoms 2013 Progress Report," Tayyar, January 3, 2014, http://www.tra.gov.lb/Library/Files/Uploaded%20files/Law431/Law-431-EN...

- 37Republic of Lebanon Telecommunications Regulatory Authority,
 "Facts and Figures," December 2011, http://www.tra.gov.lb/MarketData-Facts-and-figures; Rania Ghanem, "Service providers reduce
 internet charges 50 percent," Business News, August 11,
 2017, http://www.businessnews.com.lb/cms/Story/StoryDetails.aspx?
 ItemID=6187; Matt Nash, "Unleash the speed: Ogero flips a switch
 and local internet transforms," Executive Magazine, May 11,
 2017, http://www.executive-magazine.com/economicspolicy/unleash-the-speed
- 38"Lebanon," IP Infor, Accessed August 2023, https://ipinfo.io/countries/lb
- 39According to the Telecommunications Regulatory Authority (TRA), it
 is TRA's prerogative to assess and grant license to ISPs, but the past
 three ministers of telecommunication have considered that the TRA
 has no legal authority to do so, and the ministry has used an old law
 as a basis for their right to grant such license. See below for conflicts
 between the TRA and the Telecommunications Ministry.
- 40Sarah Mallat, "Mapping Digital Media: Lebanon," Open Society Foundations, May 2012, http://osf.to/1EOX3Kt
- 41"About Us," Touch, accessed September 2021, http://www.touch.com.lb/autoforms/portal/touch/about-touch/who-we-are/a...; "Overview About Alfa," Alfa, accessed September 2021, https://web.archive.org/web/20170216014412/https://www.alfa.com.lb/abou...
- 42Laila Bassam and Timour Azhari, "'No money left': Lebanese telcos close to meltdown as cable thieves thrive," Reuters, January 13, 2022, https://www.reuters.com/business/media-telecom/no-money-left-lebanese-t...
- 43"Alfa and Touch switch subscribers' balances to LBP [REPORT]," LBC Group, March 3, 2022, https://www.lbcgroup.tv/news/d/news-bulletin-reports/634338/alfa-and-to...
- 44Elie el Ferzli, "[عقاب جماعي لمشتركي الخلوي: نموذج جديد عن سوء إدارة الشأن العام]" Legal Agenda, March 10, 2022, https://legalagenda.com/%D8%B9%D9%82%D8%A7%D8%A8-%D8%AC%D9%85%D8%A7%D8...
- 45Abed Kataya, "What Is The Fate Of Lebanon's (.Lb) Domains?," SMEX, September 7, 2021, https://smex.org/what-is-the-fate-of-lebanons-lb-domains/
- 46Guilhem Dorandeau, "Could Lebanon be cut off from the internet?," L'Orient Today, January 25, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1325773/could-lebanon-be-cut-of...

- 47Republic of Lebanon Telecommunications Regulatory Authority, "Publications – Annual Reports," accessed September 2021, http://www.tra.gov.lb/Annual-reports
- 48Sarah Mallat, "Mapping Digital Media: Lebanon," Open Society Foundations, May 2012, http://osf.to/1EOX3Kt
- 49Sami Halabi, "Redialing discord?," Executive Magazine, July 3, 2011, https://www.executive-magazine.com/economics-policy/redialing-discord/4...
- 50SMEX, @SMEX, "Tests using the @OpenObservatory app show that @alfatelecomusers can access @Grindr but the app is still blocked on @touchlebanon, "Install the Ooni app and keep us updated about the #GrindrLebBan or any other blocked website!," January 24, 2019, https://twitter.com/SMEX/status/1088428359569281024; "Grindr app ban by Telecoms Ministry draws criticism," The Daily Star, May 28, 2019, https://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Lebanon-News/2019/May-28/484137-grind...; "Statement: Block of Grindr App in Lebanon," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), January 23, 2019, https://smex.org/statement-block-of-grindr-app-in-lebanon/
- 51Philippe Hage Boutros, "Blocking Wix in Lebanon: the knowns and the unknowns," L'Orient-Le Jour, December, 24, 2018, https://www.lorientlejour.com/article/1149839/blocking-wix-in-lebanon-t...
- 52Safaa Ayyad, "Does Blocking Bold in Lebanon Serve the Interests of Drivers or Monopolists?," SMEX, May 16, 2023, https://smex.org/does-blocking-bolt-in-lebanon-serve-the-interests-of-d...
- 53Safaa Ayyad, "Does Blocking Bold in Lebanon Serve the Interests of Drivers or Monopolists?," SMEX, May 16, 2023, https://smex.org/does-blocking-bolt-in-lebanon-serve-the-interests-of-d...
- 54"Lebanon Blocks Unofficial Exchange Rate Apps, Threatening Right to Access Information," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), May 7, 2020, https://smex.org/lebanon-blocks-unofficial-exchange-rate-apps-threateni...
- 55Ali Sibai, Marianne Rahme, "Internet Censorship in Lebanon: The case of currency exchange rate online platforms," SMEX, March 12, 2021, https://smex.org/internet-censorship-in-lebanon-the-case-of-currency-ex...
- 56Raphael Abdelnour, "Two Lebanese media outlets summoned by security services," L'Orient Today, March 31, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333321/megaphonefounder-summo...
- 57"RSF denounces unlawful summoning megaphone news director Lebanon," RSF, Accessed August 2023, https://rsf.org/en/rsf-denounces-unlawful-summoning-megaphone-news-dire...

- 58Raphael Abdelnour, "Two Lebanese media outlets summoned by security services," L'Orient Today, March 31, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333321/megaphonefounder-summo...
- 59"Journalist Lara Bitar refuses interrogation by Anti-Cybercrime Bureau," L'Orient Today, April 6, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333994/journalist-larabitar-r...
- 60"Behind the Summons of Nizar Saghiye, a Threat to Freedom of Expression," Frontline Defenders, April 2, 2023, https://www.frontlinedefenders.org/en/statementreport/behind-summons-n...
- 61"The Coalition for Freedom of Expression in Lebanon: Court decision is a blow to freedom of expression and independence of lawyers," Legal Agenda, May 12, 2023, https://english.legalagenda.com/the-coalition-for-freedom-of-expressio...
- 62"Activist Hayat Mirshad refuses to appear before criminal court,"
 L'Orient Today, June 2,
 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1339313/activist-hayat-mirshad-...
- 63"Ghassan Rifi," Muhal, June 28, 2022, https://muhal.org/en/cases/251
- 64"Nidal Al Sabaa," Muhal, October 3, 2022, https://muhal.org/en/cases/250
- 65"Law No.81 Relating to Electronic Transactions and Personal Data," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), October 10, 2018, https://smex.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/E-transaction-law-Lebanon-O...
- 66According to reports, the order came after an alleged child molester in Lebanon was reported to the Cybercrime and Intellectual Property Rights Bureau from a police station in Manchester, UK. Sources from the Cybercrime and Intellectual Property Rights Bureau who were present during the interrogation of the accused individual revealed that the websites were chosen because they appeared in the browser history of his personal laptop, and not necessarily because they published child pornography. A prominent Lebanese blogger and social media expert wrote that the websites were among the most famous pornographic websites worldwide and were unlikely to feature child pornography, given that they are not censored in other countries that ban child pornography. See: Imad Bazzi, "كيف ولماذا" How and Why Six Porn Websites were Banned] حجبت المواقع الإباحية في لبنان؟ in Lebanon]," Trella, September 3, 2014, http://trella.org/4234; and النيابة العامة تأمر بحجب ستة واقع إباحية في إطار مكافحة التحرش" ,Samir Kassir Eyes [General Prosecutor Orders the Blocking of Six Porn Sites to] بالأطفال

- Combat Child Harassment]," SKeyes Center for Media and Cultural Freedom,
 September 2,
 2014, http://www.skeyesmedia.org/ar/News/Lebanon/4728
- 67"Inforamation Ministry Publishes Media Draft Law On Its Website,"
 Ministry Info, November 7,
 2022, https://www.ministryinfo.gov.lb/en/79025
- 68Aya Majzoub, "Freedom of speech in Lebanon is under threat," MEI@75, May 3, 2021, https://www.mei.edu/publications/freedom-speech-lebanon-under-threat
- 69Aya Majzoub, "Freedom of speech in Lebanon is under threat," MEI@75, May 3, 2021, https://www.mei.edu/publications/freedom-speech-lebanon-under-threat
- 70Zeina Antonios, "Media draft law to settle disputes out of court,"
 L'Orient Today, April 28,
 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1335908/media-draft-law-to-sett...; "Coalition to Defend Freedom of Expression: Authorities must respect freedoms of the press and legal profession and fundamentally amend defamation laws," Coalition to Defend Freedom of Expression, April 5, 2023, https://english.legalagenda.com/coalition-to-defend-freedom-of-express...
- 71Kareem Chehayeb, "US authorities take down 13 Hezbollahaffiliated web domains," AP News, May 11, 2023, https://apnews.com/article/hezbollah-sanctions-lebanonunited-states-33...
- 72Safaa Ayyad, "Lebanon: Summoning Journalists In Beirut And Silencing Voices In Mount Lebanon," SMEX, April 5, 2023, https://smex.org/lebanon-summoning-journalists-in-beirutand-silencing-...
- 73Karen Zaatari, "Who are Lebanon's 'Soldiers of God'?," Daraj, September 12, 2022, https://daraj.media/en/101291/
- 74"Behind the Summons of Nizar Saghiye, a Threat to Freedom of Expression," Frontline Defenders, April 2, 2023, https://www.frontlinedefenders.org/en/statement-report/behind-summons-n...; "Independence of the Judiciary Coalition Statement on Gaging Judges: A Blackout Imposed via Professional Ethics," Legal Agenda, May 9, 2023, https://english.legalagenda.com/independence-of-the-judiciary-coalitio...
- 75"Online," Media Ownership Monitor Lebanon, September 2018, http://lebanon.mom-rsf.org/en/media/online/
- 76Sarah Mallat, "Mapping Digital Media: Lebanon," Open Society Foundations, May 2012, http://osf.to/1EOX3Kt; Sarah El-Richani, The Lebanese Media: Anatomy of a System in Perpetual Crisis, New York: Palgrave McMillan, 2016, pp. 103-105.

- 78Pierre Pahlavi, "Digital Hezbollah and Political Warfare in Cyberspace," National Interest, October 31, 2022, https://nationalinterest.org/feature/digital-hezbollah-and-political-wa...
- 79"Information manipulation on social media during the Lebanese parliamentary elections, Maharat Foundation, Accessed August 2023, https://maharatfoundation.org/media/2253/dri-report-englishfinal.pdf
- 80Justin Salhani, "Disinformation and Electronic Armies: how Lebanon's political class uses fake news to win elections," the New Arab, January 13, 2022, https://english.alaraby.co.uk/analysis/disinformation-and-electronic-ar...
- 81"Hezbollah's fake news training camps revealed," Arab News, August 2, 2020, https://www.arabnews.com/node/1713611/middle-east
- 83Emilio Iasiello, "Hezbollah's Information-Enabled Capabilities are a Quiet Force," Strike Source, March 18, 2021, https://strikesource.com/2021/03/08/hezbollahs-information-enabled-capa...
- 85Chandia El and Marc Dib, "Media Law in Lebanon: An Overview,"
 Media Law International, accessed September
 2021, https://www.medialawinternational.com/page148.html
- 86Sarah Mallat, "Mapping Digital Media: Lebanon," Open Society Foundations, May 2012, http://osf.to/1EOX3Kt; Sarah El-Richani, The Lebanese Media: Anatomy of a System in Perpetual Crisis, New York: Palgrave McMillan, 2016, pp. 103-105.
- 87Sarah Mallat, "Mapping Digital Media: Lebanon," Open Society Foundations, May 2012, http://osf.to/1EOX3Kt

- 88Tala Ramadan, Controversy sparked by sexologist Sandrine Atallah's online video, L'Orient Today, December 15, 2021, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1284840/controversy-sparked-by-...
- 89"Queer Arabs Fight for Digital Freedom," Fanack, February 12, 2022, https://fanack.com/lgbtq-en/queer-arabs-fight-for-digital-freedom~22627...
- 90"Lebanon: Social Networks," Media Landscapes, accessed September
 2021, https://medialandscapes.org/country/lebanon/media/social-networks
- 91"A space to listen: Lebanese tackle crisis on Clubhouse," France24, April 6, 2021, https://www.france24.com/en/live-news/20210406-a-space-to-listen-lebane...; Fatima Al Mahmoud, "How Clubhouse is encouraging dialogue in Lebanon among citizens and politicians," The National News, April 7, 2021, https://www.thenationalnews.com/arts-culture/how-clubhouse-is-encouragi...
- 92Aya Iskandarani, "Lebanon: Hezbollah critics report threats on Clubhouse app," The National News, April 9, 2021, https://www.thenationalnews.com/mena/lebanon/lebanon-hezbollah-critics-...
- 93"Lebanese newspaper Daily Star closes," Reuters, November 2, 2021, https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/lebanesenewspaper-daily-star...
- 94"Information manipulation on social media during the Lebanese parliamentary elections, Maharat Foundation, Accessed August 2023, https://maharatfoundation.org/media/2253/dri-report-englishfinal.pdf
- 95"Behind the Summons of Nizar Saghiye, a Threat to Freedom of Expression," Frontline Defenders, April 2, 2023, https://www.frontlinedefenders.org/en/statementreport/behind-summons-n...
- 96Ben Hubbard and Mona el Naggar, "Clashes erupt in Beirut at Blast Protest as Lebanon's anger boils over," The New York Times, August 8,
 2020, https://www.nytimes.com/2020/08/08/world/middleeast/Beirut -explosion-pr...
- 97Sofia Cherici, "Lebanon protests: Authorities prey on digital spaces to silence criticism," Advox Global Voices, September 18, 2020, https://advox.globalvoices.org/2020/09/18/lebanon-protestsauthorities-...
- 98Said Benarbia, "Lebanon: the ICF calls for extensive reforms to strengthen judicial independence and accountability," International

- Commission of Jurists, February 28, 2017, https://www.icj.org/lebanon-the-icj-calls-for-extensive-reforms-to-stre...
- 99"Lebanon: Right of Access to Information Law a major step despite enforcement challenges," Article 19, February 24, 2017, https://www.article19.org/resources/lebanon-right-of-accessto-informat...
- 100"Responses," Gherbal Initiative, accessed September 2021, https://web.archive.org/web/20190511075338/http://elgherbal.org:80/en/r...
- 101"The Legal Agenda Statement: Four Objections to the Declaration of a State of Emergency," Legal Agenda, August 21, 2020, https://english.legal-agenda.com/legal-agenda-statement-fourobjections...
- 102M. Al-Lehham, "Beirut under emergency until the end of 2020: a breach of the constitution and the law, with persistence and assurance," The Legal Agenda, September 25, 2020, https://legalagenda.com/بيروت-تحت-الطوارئ-حتى-آخر-2020-خرق-للاستور/
- 103"Lebanon: Pattern of Prosecutions for Free Speech," Human Rights Watch, January 31, 2018, https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/01/31/lebanon-patternprosecutions-free-s...
- 104" ما يرِد على صفحات «الفايسبوك» يخضع لقانون العقوبات لا «المطبوعات "What appears on "Facebook" pages is subject to the penal code, not "publications"]," Addiyar, February 16, 2016, https://goo.gl/5bXAfG
- 105 «ما يرد على صفحات «الفايسبوك» يخضع لقانون العقوبات لا «المطبوعات (What appears on "Facebook" pages is subject to the penal code, not "publications"]," Addiyar, February 16, 2016, https://goo.gl/5bXAfG
- 106"Coalition to Defend Freedom of Expression: Authorities must respect freedoms of the press and legal profession and fundamentally amend defamation laws," Legal Agenda, April 5, 2023, https://english.legal-agenda.com/coalition-to-defend-freedomof-express...
- 107"Lebanon: Pattern of Prosecutions for Free Speech," Human Rights Watch, January 31, 2018, https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/01/31/lebanon-patternprosecutions-free-s...
- 108Ghida Frangieh, " مكتب مكافحة الجرائم المعلوماتية: رقابة غير منظمة على المساحات (Bureau of Cybercrimes: An Unorganized Online Censorship]," Legal Agenda, December 3, 2013, https://www.legalagenda.com/article.php?id=594&lang=ar
- 109"Michel Moutran," Muhal, July 10, 2022, https://muhal.org/en/cases/248

- 110"Coalition to Defend Freedom of Expression: Authorities must respect freedoms of the press and legal profession and fundamentally amend defamation laws," Legal Agenda, April 5, 2023, https://english.legal-agenda.com/coalition-to-defend-freedomof-express...
- 111"RST denounces unlawful summinging of megaphone news director," RSF, Accessed august 2023, https://rsf.org/en/rsfdenounces-unlawful-summoning-megaphone-news-dire...; Raphael Abdelnour, "Two Lebanese media outlets summoned by security services," L'Orient Today, March https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333321/megaphone-2023, founder-summo...; "Journalist Lara Bitar refuses interrogation by Anti-Bureau," Cybercrime L'Orient Today, 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1333994/journalist-larabitar-r...;
- 112"Behind the Summons of Nizar Saghiye, a Threat to Freedom of Expression," Frontline Defenders, April 2, 2023, https://www.frontlinedefenders.org/en/statementreport/behind-summons-n...
- 113"Activist Hayat Mirshad refuses to appear before criminal court,"
 L'Orient Today, June 2,
 2023, https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1339313/activist-hayat-mirshad-...
- 114"Lebanon: Stop prosecution of journalist Radwan Mortada,"
 Article 19, December 13,
 2021, https://www.article19.org/resources/lebanon-stop-prosecution-of-journal...
- 115Grant Baker, "The Future of Biometric and Digital ID in Lebanon:
 Assessing Proposed Systems for Elections and Social Assistance,"
 Social Media Exchange (SMEX), January 27,
 2021, https://smex.org/the-future-of-biometrics-and-digital-id-in-lebanon-ass...
- 116"Ministry of Telecommunications' IMEI Registration Policy Threatens Digital Privacy," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), December 4, 2018, https://smex.org/ministry-of-telecommunications-imei-registration-polic...
- 117Lara Bitar, "A Brief History of Personal Data Collection in Lebanon," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), December 18, 2017, https://smex.org/a-brief-history-of-personal-data-collection-inlebanon/
- 118Abed Kataya, "Touch Enforcing Strict SIM Policy After Corruption Scandal," SMEX, May 4, 2023, https://smex.org/touch-enforcing-strict-sim-policy-after-corruption-sca...

- 119Marianne Rahme, "Device Seizures in Lebanon: Assessing the Legal Framework concerning device seizures," Social Media Exchange (SMEX), February 1, 2021, https://smex.org/device-seizures-in-lebanon-assessing-the-legal-framewo...
- 120Mohamad Najem (ed. Lara Bitar), "Mapping the Landscape of Digital Surveillance in Lebanon," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX),
 2016, https://web.archive.org/web/20171014235904/https://www.smex.org/wp-cont...
- 121"State of Privacy: Lebanon," Privacy International, January 2018, https://web.archive.org/web/20180420091324/https://privacyinternational...
- 122Bill Marczak, John Scott-Railton, Sarah McKune, Bahr Abdul Razzak, and Ron Deibert, "Hide And Seek: Tracking NSO Group's Pegasus Spyware To Operations In 45 Countries," Citizen Lab, September 18, 2018, https://citizenlab.ca/2018/09/HIDE-AND-SEEK-TRACKING-NSO-GROUPS-PEGASUS...
- 123Craig Timberg, Pegasus hack reported on iPhones of Human Rights Watch official, The Washington Post, January 26, 2022, https://www.washingtonpost.com/technology/2022/01/26/pega sus-hack-repor...; Craig Timberg, Michael Birnbaum, Drew Harwell and Dan Sabbagh, On the list: Ten prime ministers, three presidents and a king, The Washington Post, July 20, 2021, https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/2021/07/20/heads-of-state-pegasus-...
- 124"؟ وشيك؟" [The "spying" program on mobile subscribers: waste or imminent "success"?]," Al-Akhbar, February 14, 2020, https://al-akhbar.com/Community/284136/
- 125"Dark Caracal: Cyberespionage at a Global Scale," Lookout and Electronic Frontier Foundation, January 18, 2018, https://info.lookout.com/rs/051-ESQ-475/images/Lookout_Dark-Caracal_srr...
- 126"SMEX Launches Inaugural Report on Digital Surveillance in Lebanon," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), December 14, 2016, https://smex.org/smex-launches-inaugural-report-on-digitalsurveillance...
- 127Deborah Amos, "Lebanon's Government Is Accused Of Swarming WhatsApp To Catch Protesters," NPR, March 9, 2020, https://www.npr.org/2020/03/09/809684634/lebanonsgovernment-is-accused...
- 128Marianne Rahme, "Device Seizures in Lebanon: Assessing the Legal Framework concerning device seizures," Social Media Exchange

- (SMEX), February 1, 2021, https://smex.org/device-seizures-in-lebanon-assessing-the-legal-framewo...
- 129"Biometric Lebanese passports issuance," General Directorate of General Security, (n.d.), Accessed September 2021, http://www.general-security.gov.lb/en/posts/182
- 130Lara Bitar, "A Brief History of Personal Data Collection in Lebanon," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), December 18, 2017, https://smex.org/a-brief-history-of-personal-data-collection-inlebanon/
- 131Mohamad Najem, "Questions the Lebanese Government Should Answer about the New Biometric Passports," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), July 19, 2016, https://smex.org/legitimate-questions-about-biometric-passport-lebanese...
- 132"Lebanon: Privacy Landscape," Data Guidance, July 2020, https://www.dataguidance.com/opinion/lebanon-privacy-landscape; "State of Privacy Lebanon," Privacy International, January 27, 2019, https://privacyinternational.org/state-privacy/1081/state-privacy-leban...
- 133"An "Ugly" New Data Protection Law in Lebanon," Social Media Exchange Association (SMEX), October 11, 2018, https://smex.org/anugly-new-data-protection-law-in-lebanon/
- 134@monajem, "Gov in #Lebanon is pushing UNHCR to give them all refugees data. This includes so many biometric data and other personal identified information PII. We advise against it," Twitter, May 4, 2023, https://twitter.com/monajem/status/1654170391332413440? s=46&t=wPdPxjLm-...
- 135"Lebanon," Facebook Transparency, June 2022, https://transparency.facebook.com/government-datarequests/country/LB; "Lebanon," Twitter Transparency, June 2022, https://transparency.twitter.com/en/countries/lb.html
- 136Abed Kataya, Referring Telecom Data To Security Agencies Breaches The Lebanese Law, SMEX, 26 October 2021, https://smex.org/referring-telecom-data-to-security-agenciesbreaches-t...
- 137Aya Iskandarani, "Lebanon: Hezbollah critics report threats on Clubhouse app," The National News, April 9, 2021, https://www.thenationalnews.com/mena/lebanon/lebanon-hezbollah-critics-...
- 138"Lebanese photojournalist Hasan Shaaban beaten and threated with Death," CPJ, August 2022, https://cpj.org/2022/08/lebanese-photojournalist-hasan-shaaban-beaten-t...
- 139"Two Lebanese journalists threatened by Hezbollah supporters, again," RSF, Accessed August 2023, https://rsf.org/en/two-lebanese-

journalists-threatened-hezbollah-suppor...

- 140Marie Jo Sader, "How Hezbollah's electronic army is 'assassinating'
 Tarek Bitar," October 21, 2021, L'Oreint le Jour,
 https://today.lorientlejour.com/article/1278751/how-hezbollahselectron...
- 141"[Report] Doxxing Of Residential Information Targeting Vulnerable Groups: Online And Offline Harms," SMEX, February 8, 2022, https://smex.org/report-doxxing-of-residential-information-targeting-vu...
- 142Naseem Tarawnah, "Women's voices battle surveillance, sexual violence, and online trolls," IFEX, March 7, 2022, https://ifex.org/women-voices-in-mena-battle-surveillancesexual-violen...
- 143Karen Zaatari, "Who are Lebanon's 'Soldiers of God'?," Daraj, September 12, 2022, https://daraj.media/en/101291/
- 144"Lebanon's Unlawful Crackdeown on LGBTI Gatherings," Human Rights Watch, July 4, 2022, https://www.hrw.org/news/2022/07/04/lebanon-unlawfulcrackdown-lgbti-ga...
- 145Martin Chulov, "Hezbollah critic Lokman Slim found dead in Lebanon," The Guardian, February 4, 2021, https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/feb/04/hezbollahcritic-lokman-s...
- 146", الكاتب الصحافي لقمان سليم ضيف قناة الحدث YouTube, January 15, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8STKGdZdRN0&t=167s
- 147Karine Keuchkerian, "Over 1.8 Million Lebanese WhatsApp Users' Data Were Leaked And Are Being Sold On The Dark Web," The 961, November 30, 3033, https://www.the961.com/lebanese-whatsapp-users-data-leaked-on-dark-web/
- 148Ravie Lakshmanan, "Microsoft Blocks Iran-linked Lebanese Hackers Targeting Israeli Companies," The Hacker News, June 3, 2022, https://thehackernews.com/2022/06/microsoft-blocks-iran-linked-lebanese...
- 149Benjamin Young, "How Iran Built Hezbollah Into a Top Cyber Power," The National Interest, April 11, 2022, https://nationalinterest.org/blog/techland-when-great-powercompetition...
- 150Nohad Topalian, "Hizbullah hackers caught carrying out cyber espionage worldwide," Al-Mashareq, February 5, 2021, https://almashareq.com/en_GB/articles/cnmi_am/features/202 1/02/05/featu...

- 151Shannon Vavra, "Fake job listings help suspected Iranian hackers aim at targets in Lebanon," CyberScoop, April 8, 2021, https://www.cyberscoop.com/iran-apt34-oilrig-lebanon-jobdecoy-check-po...
- 152"Lebanon Seeks to Create Agency to Fight Cyber Crime," Al Bawaba,
 December
 18,
 2018, https://www.albawaba.com/editorchoice/lebanon-seeks-create-agency-fight...
- 153Rudy Shoushany, "A weak position in the undeclared cyber war," Executive Magazine, September 28, 2022, https://www.executive-magazine.com/special-report/a-weak-position-in-th...

ecoi.net description:

Report on digital media and internet freedom (reporting period June 2022 - May 2023)

Country:

Lebanon

Source:

Freedom House (Author)

Original link:

https://freedomhouse.org/country/lebanon/freedom-net/2023

Document type:

Expert Opinion or Position

Language:

English

Published:

4 October 2023

Available on ecoi.net since:

30 November 2023

Document ID:

2100690

Austrian Red Cross
Austrian Centre for
Country of Origin and
Asylum Research and
Documentation
(ACCORD)

Wiedner Hauptstraße 32, 1041 Wien T +43 1 589 00 583 F +43 1 589 00 589 info@ecoi.net Contact Imprint & Disclaimer F.A.Q. Data Protection Notice

ecoi.net is run by the Austrian Red Cross (department ACCORD) in cooperation with Informationsverbund Asyl & Migration. ecoi.net is funded by the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund, the Austrian Ministry of the Interior and Caritas Austria. ecoi.net is supported by ECRE & UNHCR.











