Flygtningenævnets baggrundsmateriale

Bilagsnr.:	240
Land:	Rwanda
Kilde:	Freedom House
Titel:	Freedom on the Net 2021 – Rwanda
Udgivet:	21. september 2021
Optaget på baggrundsmaterialet:	14. januar 2022

Freedom House

Freedom on the Net 2021 - Rwanda

Not Free 38 / 100

A Obstacles to Access 13 / 25 **B** Limits on Content 11 / 35 C Violations of User Rights 14 / 40

Last Year's Score & Status

39 / 100 Not Free

Scores are based on a scale of 0 (least free) to 100 (most free)

Overview

Internet freedom in Rwanda continued to decline during the coverage period, with the government taking steps to detain, intimidate, and block the content of online journalists and critics. Selfcensorship online remains common, as the government increasingly tightens its control of the online media environment. Recent evidence implicates Rwandan authorities in the widespread use of commercial surveillance tools against journalists, activists, and opposition leaders.

President Paul Kagame and the Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) have ruled Rwanda since 1994, and maintain tight control over the political system. The government habitually suppresses political dissent through pervasive surveillance, intimidation, arrest, and suspected assassinations of dissidents, including across borders.

Key Developments, June 1, 2020 - May 31, 2021

- In December 2020, the Rwanda Media Commission (RMC) suspended plans to require YouTube channels to register with the RMC, originally announced earlier that month, which would have required channels to present journalist credentials and pay a licensing fee (see B6).
- While Rwandans supported government-approved campaigns on social media during the coverage period, the online environment severely hampers online mobilization, especially due to the overwhelming pressure to self-censor criticism of the government (see B8).
- A leaked dataset indicated that Rwandan authorities considered targeting over 3,500 phone numbers linked to Rwandan activists, journalists, and politicians with Pegasus, a surveillance tool developed by the Israeli technology company NSO Group (see C5).
- Government officials increasingly targeted individuals associated with YouTube news channels through arrests and online harassment, particularly those that challenge the government's narrative on sensitive issues; some YouTubers experienced months-long pretrial detention (see C3 and C7).
- Rwanda's draft data protection bill—which would enshrine key data rights but presents a threat to media sites and requires data localization—advanced through the legislative process during the coverage period (see C6).

A Obstacles to Access

A1 0-6 pts

Access to information and communication technologies (ICTs) in Rwanda has improved notably in recent years. The government has invested in building its internet infrastructure and other ICTs in its efforts to develop a robust information economy.

The Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Agency (RURA), the sector regulator, reported an increase in internet usage by Rwandans, from 60.4 percent in 2019 to 62.5 percent in its December 2020.1 The Digital 2021 report, in contrast, reported a 31.4 percent internet penetration rate in January 2021.2 Most Rwandans access the internet via smartphones.

According to the government, over 90 percent of the population lives in areas covered by broadband networks. International Telecommunication Union (ITU) data reported that less than 1 percent of the population uses fixed-broadband internet as of 2019. Government investments in broadband technology across the country continued to grow during the reporting period (see A2). The ITU is collaborating with RURA to further expand broadband coverage (see A2).

According to internet speeds aggregator Ookla, Rwandans averaged mobile download speeds of 16.9 megabits per second (Mbps) and upload speeds of 6 Mbps as of November 2020, the most recent available data, and fixed broadband download speeds of 20.3 Mbps and upload speeds of 24.8 Mbps as of May 2021.6 During the COVID-19 pandemic, mobile broadband subscribers experienced drastic internet slowdowns. Subscribers of MTN and Airtel reported service disruptions and speeds as low as 55 Kbps in April 2020.7

Limited fixed-line infrastructure has negatively impacted internet access. Nevertheless, developments in the fixed-network market have improved connectivity and reliability. Operators have rolled out national fiber-optic backbone networks to connect to the international submarine fiber-optic cables on the east coast of Africa. These cables have provided the entire region with fiber-based international bandwidth for the first time, ending the dependency on satellites. As of April 2020, internet service provider (ISP) Liquid Telecom continued to expand fiber-to-the-premises (FTTP) services in the capital city of Kigali and some small towns.8

In December 2019, Korea Telecom Rwanda Networks (KTRN) announced a \$10 million project aimed at improving connectivity across the country. <u>9</u> KTRN is a wholesale provider of a universal mobile broadband network built on fourth-generation long-term-evolution (4G LTE) technology. National LTE coverage was achieved in 2018. <u>10</u>

Improved access to electricity via hydropower and solar energy projects has helped increase internet connection speeds and decrease costs. However, according to the government, 65 percent of the population had access to electricity as of June 2021,11 which falls far short of the government's ambitious plan to achieve 100-percent electrification by 2024.

A2 0-3 pts

ls access to the internet prohibitively expensive or beyond the reach of certain segments of the population for geographical, social, or other reasons?

Internet access is primarily concentrated in Kigali and remains beyond the reach of many citizens, particularly those in rural areas who are limited by low income and low levels of ICT awareness. 12 However, there have been efforts to reduce costs and expand service to underserved communities.

Poverty continues to be the primary impediment to internet access, with the majority of the population engaged in subsistence agriculture. The Inclusive Internet Index 2021 report ranks Rwanda 109th of 120 countries for affordability, but notes that Rwanda ranks second overall among the low-income countries assessed by the index.13

Expatistan, an online index that measures the cost of living across countries, estimated that the price of internet service at 8 Mbps in Kigali was nearly 36,799 Rwandan francs (\$37) per month as of February, 2021, which remains prohibitively expensive for the majority of residents.14 In March 2020, Liquid Telecom launched new fiber-optic broadband services in Kigali. According to Liquid Telecom officials, users would receive unlimited high-speed internet access, significant price reductions, and free installation.15 The company also announced a significant reduction in fiber-to-home internet service costs, with prices starting at 29,287 francs (\$30) for a month of unlimited connectivity at 5 Mbps.16 This remains on the costlier side for many Kigali residents.

Rwandans were critical about the poor quality of internet service amid the COVID-19 crisis lockdown measures, as the majority of office workers were forced to work from home. When schools closed during the lockdown, learning shifted online, primarily through content distributed via radio, television, and YouTube. 17

Fewer than 10 percent of Rwandans are digitally literate as of 2019,18 and over 70 percent of the population speaks only Kinyarwanda, making internet content in English inaccessible to the majority of Rwandans.19

The joint ITU and RURA broadband expansion project aims to increase connectivity in rural areas and improve access to government services and information. According to the ITU, the project also aims to provide free or low-cost internet access to schools, hospitals, and underserved populations. 20 In February 2019, OneWeb, a UK-based company, launched a satellite that brings internet access to schools in remote areas. 21 In April 2020, OneWeb filed a bankruptcy relief case in a U.S bankruptcy court, which could disrupt its projects globally; Paula Ingabire, minister of information and community technology and innovation, said Rwanda's partnership with OneWeb would continue. 22

A3 0-6 pts

Does the government exercise technical or legal control over internet infrastructure for 5 / the purposes of restricting connectivity? 6

There were no restrictions on connectivity reported in Rwanda during the coverage period, though Article 52 of the 2001 Law Governing Telecommunications gives the government excessive powers over telecommunications networks in the name of preserving "national integrity." These powers include the ability to "suspend a telecommunications service for an indeterminate period, either generally or for certain communications."23

The local internet exchange point (IXP), the Rwanda Internet Exchange (RINEX),24 is managed by the Rwanda Information & Communications Technology Association, a nonprofit organization comprised of ICT institutions and professionals.25

Since 2013, IHS Towers, Africa's largest operator of telecommunications towers, has managed most of these assets in Rwanda. Mobile service provider MTN sold over 500 towers to IHS Towers in 2014.26 That same year, the company agreed to acquire 212 towers from mobile service provider Millicom and 171 from Airtel.27 Internet activists believe the consolidation of telecommunications infrastructure under one company's ownership may permit the government to exercise greater control over these assets, and that the government collects massive intelligence data with the help of IHS Towers.28

A4 0-6 pts

Are there legal, regulatory, or economic obstacles that restrict the diversity of service 3 / providers? 6

RURA is not transparent in its oversight of ISPs.

As of September 2020, at least 25 ISPs were licensed. 29 In 2019, an anonymous source from within RURA's legal department said that the majority of ISPs were no longer operational due to the dominance of MTN and Airtel. According to the source, the hegemony of these two companies is in the state's interest because centralization allows RURA to more easily monitor users. 30 According to local sources, government officials and agencies have shares in some telecommunications companies, which may enable the state to interfere in their operations.

A5 0-4 pts

Do national regulatory bodies that oversee service providers and digital technology fail to operate in a free, fair, and independent manner?

There are no legal guarantees for the autonomy of RURA. RURA reports directly to the office of the prime minister. The government audits RURA's budget, while the president nominates its seven board members, supervisory board, and director general, limiting its autonomy in practice. 31 Ernest Nsabimana, previously a vice mayor of Kigali, was appointed director general of RURA in December 2020.32

Appointments to RURA have raised concerns about the influence of the military and intelligence services over the regulation of the ICT sector.33 Prior to Nsabimana, RURA's director general was Patrick Nyirishema, a senior military officer.34 Former assistant police commissioner Anthony Kulamba, who also served as the Rwanda National Police (RNP) commissioner for Interpol,35 currently serves as RURA's head of media regulation and consumer affairs.36

There are no mechanisms for ISPs or other companies regulated by RURA to appeal its decisions. 37 Furthermore, no self-regulatory mechanism is available for ISPs. 38

B Limits on Content

B1 0-6 pts

Does the state block or filter, or compel service providers to block or filter, internet content, particularly material that is protected by international human rights standards?

The government restricts the types of online content that users can access, particularly material that strays from the government's official narrative.

In October 2019, the Rwandan Senate accused 26 online radio stations and websites owned by Rwandan critics living in exile of genocide denial (see C7).39 Out of the 26 websites named in the report, 11 are accessible in Rwanda as of May 2021.40 As of late 2020, numerous independent news outlets and opposition blogs that have been blocked for years reportedly remained inaccessible,41 including the website of the *Rwandan* newspaper, as well as online publications Inyenyeri News and Le Prophete.42

In August 2019, RURA blocked several Ugandan news sites, including the state-owned *New Vision* and the websites of the *Daily Monitor*, the *Observer*, SoftPower News, and the *Independent*, reciprocating the Uganda Communications Commission's (UCC) blocking of two Rwandan news sites, the *New Times* and Igihe. Both countries agreed to unblock the websites shortly afterwards. 43 As of May 2021 the websites of *New Vision*, the *Daily Monitor*, ChimpReports, *Nile Post*, and the *Independent* were inaccessible for some users in Rwanda. 44 The incident took place amid rising diplomatic tensions between the two countries in recent years. Each government, through state-sponsored media houses and social media platforms, has accused the other of espionage and intent to undermine state security. The website of SoftPower News, a Ugandan digital media company, was previously blocked in January 2018, and remained inaccessible through at least May 2019.

The websites for independent regional news outlets, such as *Great Lakes Voice*, and websites of the Rwandan diaspora, such as Rugali, are also blocked, and are only accessible via web proxy. The BBC Kinyarwanda/Kirundi website was made inaccessible in 2014 but became accessible during the previous coverage period. However, most international news sources, some of which are critical of the Rwandan government, are available online. These websites most likely remain unblocked because the majority of Rwandans engage with content in the local language, Kinyarwanda.

Social networking sites and communications apps such as YouTube, Facebook, Twitter, and WhatsApp are accessible.

B2 0-4 pts

Do state or nonstate actors employ legal, administrative, or other means to force 2 publishers, content hosts, or digital platforms to delete content, particularly material that / is protected by international human rights standards?

The extent to which the government forces websites or digital platforms to delete content is unknown, though anecdotal evidence in recent years suggests the practice is common. According to journalists who have spoken on condition of anonymity, authorities often pressure editors of news sites to delete content that is critical of the government or avoid publishing such content altogether, threatening to block sites that do not comply.45 Local journalists refer to the practice as *kunyonga* (shooting down anonymously).

Credible sources claim that the Office of the Government Spokesperson (OGS), an official propaganda entity, has administrative access to the websites of some nominally independent newspapers. Government employees reportedly remove stories deemed critical of the Kagame administration on a routine basis.

B3 0-4 pts

Do restrictions on the internet and digital content lack transparency, proportionality to the stated aims, or an independent appeals process?

RURA generally does not provide explanations when local and international news sites are blocked. Website owners have no avenue of appeal when their sites are blocked.

In May 2019, the Rwandan government announced its intention to start regulating social media content, arguing that regulation was necessary to protect citizens from misinformation and that social media platforms were being used to rally people to disrupt society. Critics say the move targets the government's opponents and independent journalists. 46 As of July 2021, the regulations had not been announced.

According to a 2010 law relating to electronic messages, signatures, and transactions, intermediaries and service providers are not held liable for content transmitted through their networks. 47 Nonetheless, service providers are required to remove content when handed a takedown notice, and there are no mechanisms for appeal.

B4 0-4 pts

Do online journalists, commentators, and ordinary users practice self-censorship? $\,$ 0 / 4

While Rwandans are active on Facebook, Twitter, and other social media platforms, self-censorship has become more pervasive among both online journalists and ordinary users in recent years due to increasing government repression, social pressure to support the government, and fear of reprisals for those who criticize the authorities. The hostile environment for journalists, who risk prosecution and imprisonment for critical, independent reporting, contributes to self-censorship. The disappearance and murder of numerous opposition members similarly reinforces self-censorship (see C7).48 Internet users typically avoid topics that can be construed as critical of the government or disruptive to national unity and reconciliation.49

President Kagame has frequently threatened his critics and accused them of destabilizing the country, further entrenching self-censorship. In a May 2019 speech, Kagame warned opponents of his government in the diaspora when he said, "those making noise on the internet do so because they're far from the fire. If they dare get close to it, they'll face its heat." 50 Observers argued that Kagame's threats were genuine, in light of the fact that a number of Rwandan dissidents abroad have been killed or disappeared.

Financial challenges in Rwanda's media sector have driven many media houses and journalists to YouTube channels for monetization. In March 2020, one editor reported that their outlet is "exercising extreme caution" because of government restrictions on online speech (see C2). They stated that "the government started cracking down on youtubers-especially those who go against the official narrative." 51

B5 0-4 pts

Are online sources of information controlled or manipulated by the government or other powerful actors to advance a particular political interest?

Online information is manipulated by the government through editorial influence and coordinated social media campaigns.

In October 2019, the Rwandan Senate accused 26 online radio stations and websites owned by Rwandan critics living in exile of denying the 1994 genocide (see C7); the report was followed by a February 2020 campaign to share the results. 52 The accusations limited the reach of the websites named in the report, contributing to greater government control of the online media environment.

Security officials and other government authorities frequently interfere with editors at online outlets to prevent the publication of stories on certain topics and alter content that criticizes the government.53 Journalists say that editorial decisions are heavily influenced by government forces—including police officers, army officers, and powerful political leaders—whose demands are colloquially known as "I say this." For example, two anonymous sources confirmed that during the 2017 presidential campaign, editors of Igihe, an online news outlet, were not allowed to publish articles on candidates challenging President Kagame. According to journalists who were interviewed anonymously, security officials often review journalists' stories and photographs before they are published. One respondent said that authorities have tightened their control of the media by ensuring that each news organization employs a government representative to monitor editorial content.54 A wide range of institutions are required to employ government agents, especially those that the government deems to handle potentially sensitive information.

Social media accounts with government affiliations regularly debate and harass individuals who post online comments considered critical of the government. 55 For instance, in July 2020, Edouard Bamporiki, culture and youth minister, targeted Aimable Karasira, then a University of Rwanda lecturer and YouTube commentator, with social media attacks and called for his dismissal (see C7). Karasira was dismissed a month later. 56 Karasira was later arrested on genocide denial charges (see C3).

President Kagame regularly encourages supporters to represent the government's interests online. In April 2021, for instance, he chastised party cadres for not attacking those who criticize the government on social media. 57

Progovernment accounts also mobilize to retweet and post positive comments in response to President Kagame's tweets, to project an image of widespread support. Through Itorero, a state-run traditional school of values, and Intore, the graduates of this school, the government has mobilized social media users to counter the views of individuals deemed to be "enemies of the state." The so-called "Twitter Army" has systematically attacked and discredited individuals and media outlets that criticize the government.

According to local sources, these social media users are rewarded for their attacks with access to jobs at government institutions and private companies that have ties to the ruling party. One source said that intelligence services monitor and report social media users who engage constructively with government critics.

B6 0-3 pts

Are there economic or regulatory constraints that negatively affect users' ability to 1 / publish content online?

Compared to their state-run counterparts, which receive income from government advertisements and direct subsidies, independent media outlets often struggle financially. Large businesses generally only advertise with state-owned or progovernment media outlets, based on an unspoken rule.

An increasing proportion of media houses and journalists rely on YouTube channels to finance their content. In December 2020, the Rwanda Media Commission (RMC) suspended plans to require YouTube channels to register with the RMC, which had originally been announced earlier that month. In justifying the plans, the RMC cited complaints filed against YouTube channels to argue that registration would impose accountability.59 Registration reportedly required proof of journalist credentials and a fee of 50,000 francs (\$51).60 Human rights groups argued that the proposed plans would give the government another avenue to target critics and censor online expression.61

Previously, in April 2020, the RMC released a statement saying that individuals running personal YouTube channels did not qualify as journalists. 62 One editor said disqualifying YouTube channels as professional media sources could limit the already sparse safeguards for online journalists, potentially causing the collapse of online journalism in the country. 63

B7 0-4 pts

Does the online information landscape lack diversity and reliability? 1/4

Government repression of the media greatly limits the diversity and reliability of the information landscape, both online and offline.

Critical and independent online journalism produced by opposition supporters overseas—mainly in Europe, the United States, and South Africa—is blocked in Rwanda. Proxy servers can be used to access blocked content, but few Rwandans are aware of the extent of blocking or the means to circumvent it.64

Though misinformation about COVID-19 spread on social media platforms, online fact-checking efforts coordinated by the Rwandan government mitigated the potential for harm.<u>65</u>

B8 0-6 pts

Do conditions impede users' ability to mobilize, form communities, and campaign, 2 / particularly on political and social issues?

Score Change: The score declined from 3 to 2 because the online environment in Rwanda severely hampers online mobilization, particularly because of the overwhelming pressure to self-censor criticism of the government.

Digital activism on political and social issues is uncommon, despite the widespread availability of mobilization tools; no social media campaigns that criticize the government have been noted in recent years. Rampant surveillance and SIM card registration requirements have made users fearful of using digital tools for political activism that challenges the government (see C4 and C5).

Government-aligned accounts sometimes organize social media campaigns to spread progovernment narratives. For instance, the *ndi Umunyarwanda* ("I am Rwandan") program purports to build national unity and counter the spread of "genocide ideology"—a criminal act in Rwandan law that bars incitement to genocide and ethnic divisionism but is often applied to silence any dissenting views of the government's preferred narrative about the 1994 genocide (see C2). *Ndi Umunyarwanda* remained ongoing as of August 2021, with social media users posting in support of the campaign.66

C Violations of User Rights

C1 0-6 pts

Do the constitution or other laws fail to protect rights such as freedom of expression, 1 access to information, and press freedom, including on the internet, and are they / enforced by a judiciary that lacks independence?

Freedom of press, of expression, and of access to information are recognized and guaranteed by the state in Article 38 of the Rwandan Constitution,67 though Rwanda's legal framework is used to restrict fundamental rights, including online. The Rwandan judiciary is not independent, and many journalists who publish material online view the threat of imprisonment as a key constraint on their work.

In March 2020, the Rwandan government enforced measures to restrict the spread of COVID-19, including a lockdown directive that did not explicitly exempt members of the media.<u>68</u> Authorities continued to enforce the lockdown, especially in the capital Kigali, until it was lifted in March 2021.<u>69</u>

The government later issued statements to indicate that journalists must comply with the lockdown. <u>70</u> At least a dozen journalists were arrested under the directive as of July 2020 (see C3).

In April 2019, the Supreme Court repealed a law that banned the publication of political cartoons, but upheld criminal defamation against the president (see C2). The decision draws an explicit distinction between the head of state and other public officials, 71 and was viewed as evidence of the judiciary's deference to the executive.

C2 0-4 pts

Are there laws that assign criminal penalties or civil liability for online activities, particularly those that are protected under international human rights standards?

Rwandan law restricts free expression and imposes criminal and civil penalties for legitimate online activities, sometimes with high fines and maximum sentences.

A cybersecurity law passed in 2018 imposes up to five years' imprisonment and a fine between 1 million francs (\$1,024) and 3 million francs (\$3,072) for publishing "rumors that may incite fear, insurrection, or violence... or that may make a person lose their credibility."72 Additionally, anyone who "establishes, publishes, or uses a site of a terrorist group" faces imprisonment of 15 to 20 years and a fine between 20 million (\$20,486) and 50 million francs (\$51,215).73 The government considers many exiled opposition organizations "terrorist groups," which has contributed to concerns that the law will be used to further crack down on opposition activities.74

Defamation of the president is a criminal offense in Rwanda. Revisions to the penal code signed into law in 2018 impose penalties of five to seven years' imprisonment for defaming the president. 75 However, defamation against private individuals was decriminalized under the revised code. A provision in the code that criminalized the "humiliation of national authorities," including through cartoons, was overturned by the Supreme Court in April 2019 (see C1). 76 Many other provisions in the revised penal code, often vaguely worded, contain undue restrictions on freedom of expression that can be applied to online activities. Notably, the spread of "false information or harmful propaganda with intent to cause a hostile international opinion against [the] Rwanda government" carries penalties of between seven and ten years' imprisonment in peacetime and life imprisonment during wartime. 77

An ICT law enacted in 2016 created a new legal and regulatory framework for the ICT sector and codified specific restrictions on internet activities that are antithetical to internet freedom. Most notably, provisions in the law prohibit the dissemination of "grossly offensive" or "indecent" messages as well as the use of ICTs to cause "annoyance, inconvenience, or needless anxiety."79

The law against "genocide ideology"—amended in 2013—also threatens freedom of expression both online and off, prescribing heavy prison sentences of up to nine years and fines for any offender "who disseminates genocide ideology in public through documents, speeches, pictures, media, or any other means."80

C3 0-6 pts

Are individuals penalized for online activities, particularly those that are protected 2 / under international human rights standards?

Citizens and journalists are periodically arrested for online activities in Rwanda, though the high degree of self-censorship practiced by online journalists and ordinary users alike has resulted in fewer arrests in recent years. Cases may also be underreported, given the government's strict control of the media.

In May 2021, police arrested Karasira Aimable, a YouTube commentator and former university professor, and charged him with genocide denial for his social media activity.<u>81</u> He was later charged with "illicit enrichments" over funds that authorities allege he possessed with no adequate explanation. As of late July, Karasira remained in detention as court proceedings continued.<u>82</u>

On March 9, 2021, authorities arrested journalist Agnes Uwimana Nkusi, YouTuber and editor of the Umurabyo news site. Nkusi was arrested after refusing to delete a recording of Idamange Iryamugwiza Yvonne's bail hearing, on which Nkusi was reporting.83

On February 15, 2021, Rwandan authorities arrested Idamange Iryamugwiza Yvonne, an online commentator, because of comments she made on her YouTube channel criticizing government programs and the implementation of COVID-19 lockdown restrictions. On March 4, Iryamugwiza was charged with inciting insurrections or public uprising, denigrating genocide commemoration artifacts, publication of rumours, along with other charges.84 As of March 9, Iryamugwiza was ordered remanded for 30 days.85 The status of the case was not publicly available as of August 2021.

In February 2021, Innocent Bahati, a poet and singer who published poems on YouTube that were critical of government, went missing. Authorities have not reported any information on his disappearance, and he is feared dead or held in custody (see C7).86

In July 2020, Ruben Hamuli, a photographer, was arrested and charged with publication of rumors over a Twitter post. Hamuli tweeted that police incorrectly detained him for violating COVID-19 lockdown rules earlier that day. The status of Hamuli's case is not known as of August 2021.87

In March and April 2020, at least ten journalists, including five online journalists, were arrested as security forces were enforcing the COVID-19 measures. Eight of the journalists were briefly detained.88 On April 15, 2020, Rwandan authorities arrested Diodonne Niyonsenga and Fidèle Komezusenge, both affiliated with YouTube news outlet Ishema TV, in circumstances that appeared retaliatory, according to the Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ). Ishema TV had previously reported on the impact of COVID-19 directives on vulnerable populations. Niyonsenga and Komezusenge were released on March 13, 2021 after being acquitted of numerous charges; they served close to 11 months in pretrial detention.89 Others were held in pretrial detention for shorter terms: Theoneste Nsengimana of Umubavu TV, a YouTube news channel, was arrested in March 2020 and released in May, while Valentin Muhirwa and David Byiringiro of Afrimax TV, also a YouTube news channel, were arrested in March 2020 and released in April.90

In March 2019, Rwandan authorities arrested and detained a local journalist, Olivier Habimana for allegedly spreading rumors and propaganda against President Kagame through YouTube.91 Habimana was released from detention by March 2020. In October 2018, the authorities arrested Damascene Mutuyimana, Jean Baptiste Nshimiyimana, and Shadrack Niyonsenga on similar charges; all three worked as journalists for Iwacu TV, a Kinyarwanda-language news broadcaster on YouTube.92 They were still detained and were awaiting trial as of June 2021.93 In March 2020, an expert on Rwandan law said the Iwacu TV journalists were detained illegally, as their pretrial detention has exceeded the potential punishment associated with the charges against them.94

The authorities have used private conversations on mobile chat apps as evidence in prosecutions of dissidents, heightening concerns about the government's ability to intercept communications on social media platforms. In 2017, a few months after announcing her presidential election bid, Diane Rwigara was arrested, along with her mother Adeline and sister Anne (who was quickly released), for alleged tax evasion and incitement against the government.95 Rwigara was disqualified from running in the election, with the government claiming that signatures on her petition were forged.96 At a pretrial hearing in October 2017, prosecutors presented WhatsApp audio messages allegedly taken from the mobile phones of Diane and Adeline as evidence against them.97 The defendants asked for the files to be disregarded as evidence, citing that they were obtained through phone interceptions.98 The judges in the case acquitted the accused in December 2018 amid increased international scrutiny of the case, as well as a social media campaign for their release, which included a #FreeDianeRwigara campaign on Twitter.99

C4 0-4 pts

Does the government place restrictions on anonymous communication or encryption? 3 / 4

The ability to communicate anonymously is compromised by mandatory SIM card registration requirements in place since 2013.100 Under the law, RURA has unfettered access to SIM card databases managed by operators, while other "authorized" individuals or institutions may also be granted access.101

In recent years, RURA has sought to revise regulations on SIM card registration, ostensibly to tackle fraud, including SIM boxing, identity theft, and phishing. In January 2019, RURA announced that mobile phone users could not use more than three SIM cards on each network. The new regulations required users to register each SIM card with their national identification by the end of the month. Foreigners, meanwhile, can use only one SIM card. RURA justified the regulations on security grounds, arguing that the proliferation of SIM cards made it more difficult to track criminal activity.102 Critics argued that the regulations were meant to collect users' data, since many people have evaded state monitoring by buying and registering SIM cards with false identities. The various legal provisions that enable surveillance and limit anonymity are particularly troubling in the absence of a comprehensive data protection law. A data-protection provision is included in the ICT law passed in 2016, but it is limited by provisions that provide for broad national security exceptions.103

In July 2019, Airtel and MTN both reportedly sought authorization to launch biometric SIM card registration systems, pending authorization from RURA. 104 No further details were available as of May 2021.

C5 0-6 pts

Does state surveillance of internet activities infringe on users' right to privacy? 1/6

The full extent of the authorities' surveillance capabilities is unknown, though the government is known to use commercial spyware tools and there is a strong sense among observers that surveillance is pervasive. The government closely monitors social media discussions, as evidenced by the prevalence of progovernment commenters that frequently appear on social media platforms (see B5). Exiled dissidents have been attacked and murdered, despite their efforts to protect their identities, following threats from individuals inside or associated with the government. 105

The Rwandan government is known to use Pegasus, a surveillance software developed by Israeli technology firm NSO Group, against opposition figures, journalists, and human rights defenders. In July 2021, Amnesty International and Forbidden Stories identified more than 3,500 phone numbers linked to Rwandan activists, journalists, and politicians in a leaked dataset. 106 Investigators describe the dataset as a list of people of interest to NSO Group clients; the investigation identified the Rwandan government as likely client, though the government denied using Pegasus. 107 In October 2019, WhatsApp disclosed that a vulnerability in the application was exploited to target Rwandan dissents with Pegasus. WhatsApp identified at least 1,400 people targeted by the vulnerability, of which a "considerable number" were Rwandan. Confirmed targets included a journalist and a member of the opposition who were both living in exile. 108 In a 2018 report by Citizen Lab, a Canadian internet watchdog, Rwanda is listed as one of 45 countries worldwide in which devices were likely breached by Pegasus. 109

Dissidents and other targets of the Rwandan government report credible fears that their devices have been compromised by Pegasus. These include David Batenga, nephew of assassinated Kagame critic and former intelligence chief Patrick Karegeya, and members of the RNC and the United Democratic Forces-Inkingi, opposition parties the Rwandan government has accused of terrorism. 110 Members of opposition groups in exile suspect that devices belonging to Paul Rusesabagina, a prominent critic of Kagame who was abducted while traveling through the United Arab Emirates, were compromised, possibly by Pegasus. 111 A July 2021 investigation found that Carine Kanimba, Rusesabagina's daughter and an advocate for his freedom, was targeted by attempted Pegasus attacks throughout 2021, and identified several Pegasus infections on Kanimba's phone. 112

In July 2018, the government passed a law that extended surveillance powers to a civilian institution, the Office of the Ombudsman, to investigate corruption-related crimes. 113 The law came into effect as part of the new penal code in September 2018. 114 Previously, interception powers were only held by security agencies such as the police, military, intelligence services and Rwanda Investigation Bureau (RIB). The legislation was vague about whose communications could be intercepted. Press freedom advocates believe that the law could further threaten independent journalism (see C2). The interception of communications without prior authorization of a judge is still legally permissible.

The 2013 Law Relating to the Interception of Communications expanded the government's surveillance powers, authorizing high-ranking security officials to tap the communications, including online activity, of individuals considered potential threats to "public security."115 While the law requires government officials to apply for an interception warrant, warrants are issued by the national prosecutor, who is appointed by the justice minister. The national prosecutor can also issue warrants verbally in urgent security investigations, to be followed by a written warrant within 24 hours. The law also provides for the appointment of "inspectors" to ensure that authorized interceptions are carried out in accordance with the law, though the inspectors are appointed by the president and lack independence.116 There is no requirement to justify surveillance as necessary and proportionate to a legitimate aim.117

In 2015, email leaks from Italian surveillance firm Hacking Team revealed that the government attempted to purchase sophisticated spyware known as Remote Control System (RCS) in 2012.118 While the leaked emails did not confirm that a sale took place, they illustrate the government's interest in acquiring technology that can monitor and intercept user communications.

C6 0-6 pts

Does monitoring and collection of user data by service providers and other technology 2 / companies infringe on users' right to privacy?

Rwandan authorities are presumed to compel service providers to assist in monitoring and surveillance.

In May 2021, the Chamber of Deputies passed a draft data protection bill, which was approved by the cabinet in October 2020 and remains under legislative consideration as of August 2021. The bill includes provisions on data subject rights, general rules for data collection and processing, and a requirement to store persona data in Rwanda. 119 ARTICLE 19 East Africa, a freedom of expression organization, noted that the draft bill would harm digital and traditional media outlets, which are not granted a public interest exception under the law and would face risk of criminal and civil sanction

for reporting. The organization's analysis also raised concerns that the draft bill designates Rwanda's cybersecurity authority, which is not independent from government influence, as the data protection authority. 120

Under the 2013 Law Relating to the Interception of Communications (see C5), communications service providers are required to ensure that their systems have the technical capability to intercept communications on demand. Security officials also have the power to "intercept communications using equipment that is not facilitated by communication service providers," which effectively allows the authorities to hack into a telecommunications network without a provider's knowledge or assistance.121

In 2018, interviews with anonymous local sources confirmed that government representatives are systematically embedded within the operations of telecommunications companies for the purposes of surveillance. Telecommunications technicians also routinely intercept communications on behalf of the military.

According to a staff member of a major telecommunications company active in Rwanda interviewed in 2015, security agents routinely provide the company with phone numbers to target for monitoring. In most cases, these are phone numbers of journalists, opposition politicians, or government officials suspected to have ties to the opposition in exile.122

C7 0-5 pts

Are individuals subject to extralegal intimidation or physical violence by state authorities // or any other actor in relation to their online activities?

Independent journalists frequently face violence and harassment when attempting to cover news stories. As a result, many journalists have fled the country. 123 Progovernment trolls regularly harass journalists and ordinary users on social media for posts that are critical of the authorities.

YouTube journalists and commentators increasingly face online harassment for posting videos that discuss the 1994 genocide or crimes committed by the ruling Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) in its aftermath. For instance, Aimable Karasira, a commentator on the YouTube channel Ukuri Mbona TV, and Etienne Gatanazi, a commentator on Real Talk Channel, faced online harassment campaigns accusing them of working for dissident groups in exile after they posted YouTube videos expressing views critical of the government.124 Gatanzi reports that he was threatened with prosecution for genocide denial.125 Aimable was summarily dismissed from his position as a lecturer at the University of Rwanda over the allegations,126 and subsequently arrested (see C3).

Extralegal violence against dissidents, including journalists and other government critics, creates an atmosphere of intimidation. In February 2021, Innocent Bahati, a poet and singer who published poems on YouTube that are critical of the government, went missing. Authorities have not reported any information on his disappearance, and he is feared dead or held in custody. 127

In February 2020, during the previous coverage period, prominent gospel singer Kizito Mihigo was found dead in police custody. While the authorities claim he died by suicide after attempting to cross the border into Burundi, critics and human rights groups fear he was killed by security forces. 128 Mihigo first faced government scrutiny after a song of his that grieved both Tutsi and Hutu deaths during the 1994 genocide was distributed, including online; he was previously convicted of conspiring to overthrow the government in 2015, after prosecutors used private Skype and WhatsApp messages against him. 129

In October 2019, the Rwandan Senate released a report on genocide denial in foreign countries, defining genocide denial to include claims of a second genocide against Hutus. The report listed the social media accounts and websites of 26 groups and individuals that it claims deny the genocide. The list includes prominent opposition politicians and parties in exile, online radio stations, and online news sites. The report called for government agencies to monitor genocide denialism in newspapers and online, and for young people to use social media to protest genocide deniers. 130 The report prompted a wave of online harassment that targeted the websites named by the Senate. The media websites are no longer accessible in Rwanda (see B1).

Human rights organizations allege that Rwandan security forces perpetrate human rights violations, including arbitrary detention, ill treatment of detained people, torture, and forced disappearances. 131 Government officials regularly question, threaten, and arrest journalists and bloggers who express critical views on sensitive topics online. 132

C8 0-3 pts

Are websites, governmental and private entities, service providers, or individual users / subject to widespread hacking and other forms of cyberattack?

In February 2020, during the previous coverage period, news site Tarifaa reported a cyberattack against a Rwandan government data center that hosts sensitive servers. The attack reportedly brought down government websites, including those of the president and the ministry of defence. 133

The cybersecurity law passed in 2018 includes provisions that address hacking and other threats to online security (see C2). The law was passed during a period when hacking had increased. According to the authorities, hackers most commonly target financial institutions.

There were no reported technical attacks against online news outlets during the coverage period. The last reported attack occurred in April 2014, when investigative news site Ireme faced a seemingly targeted cyberattack from an unknown source.

Footnotes

- 1 Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority, "Statistics Report for Telecom, Media and Broadcasting Sector as of the Third Quarter of the Year 2020," https://rura.rw/fileadmin/Documents/ICT/statistics/Report_for_ICT_Telec...
- <u>2</u> Hootsuite & We Are Social, "Digital 2021: Rwanda," February 12, 2021, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2021-rwanda.
- <u>3</u> "In Rwanda, Broadband Internet connects rural communities to a bright future," ITU News, published October 5, 2018, https://news.itu.int/broadband-internet-connects-rural-communities-rwan....
- 4 ITU,"Individuals using the internet, 2005-2019," https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Pages/stat/default.aspx.
- 5 "In Rwanda, Broadband Internet connects rural communities to a bright future," ITU News, published October 5, 2018, https://news.itu.int/broadband-internet-connects-rural-communities-rwan....
- <u>6</u> "Rwanda's Mobile and Fixed Broadband Internet Speeds," Ookla SpeedTest Global Index, June 2021, <u>https://web.archive.org/web/20210812175324/https://www.speedtest.net/gl....</u>
- <u>7</u> "How coronavirus exposed telcom companies in Rwanda," Taarifa, April 2020, https://taarifa.rw/how-coronavirus-exposed-telcom-companies-in-rwanda/.
- <u>8</u> Budde Comm, "Rwanda- Telecoms, Mobile and Broadband- Statistics and Analyses," April 22, 2020, https://www.budde.com.au/Research/Rwanda-Telecoms-Mobile-and-Broadband-....
- <u>9</u> "USD10m upgrade for Rwandan 4G network," Commsupdate, December 2, 2019, https://www.commsupdate.com/articles/2019/12/02/usd10m-upgrade-for-rwan....
- 10 "Rwanda Telecoms, Mobile and Broadband Statistics and Analyses 2019-2023-ResearchAndMarkets.com," Business Wire, June 18, 2019, https://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20190618005819/en/Rwanda-Telecom....
- 11 "Electricity access," Rwanda Energy Group, accessed August 22, 2021, https://web.archive.org/web/20210822180233/https://www.reg.rw/what-we-d....
- 12 Republic of Rwanda Ministry of Youth and ICT, "Measuring ICT sector performance and Tracking ICT for Development (ICT4D)," December 2012, http://admin.theiguides.org/Media/Documents/Rwanda-ICT-Profile-2012.pdf.
- <u>13</u> "The Inclusive Internet Index," The Economist Intelligence Unit, 2021, <u>https://theinclusiveinternet.eiu.com/explore/countries/RW/?category=aff...</u>.
- 14 Expatistan, "The price of Internet 8 Mbps (1 month) in Kigali is 31,661 Franc," https://www.expatistan.com/price/internet/kigali
- 15 Mark Bowen, "Liquid Telecom Rwanda launches fast fibre broadband in Kigali," Intelligent CIO, March 2, 2020, https://www.intelligentcio.com/africa/2020/03/02/liquid-telecom-rwanda-...
- 16 Collins Mwai "Liquid Telecom slashes home fibre internet prices by 60%," The New Times, February 27, 2020, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/liquid-telecom-slashes-home-fibre-inter...
- <u>17</u> Subrata Dhar, "Rwanda builds a resilient education system", Global Partnership in Education, June 3, 2020, https://www.globalpartnership.org/blog/amid-coronavirus-pandemic-rwanda...
- <u>18</u> Daniel Sabiiti, "Rwanda Moves to Increase Digital Literacy Figures," November 28, 2019, <u>https://www.ktpress.rw/2019/11/rwanda-moves-to-increase-digital-literac....</u>
- 19 Timothy P. Williams, "For the third time in 11 years, Rwanda changed the language used in primary schools." Washington Post, January 24, 2020, https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/2020/01/24/third-time-11-years-...

- <u>20</u> "In Rwanda, Broadband Internet connects rural communities to a bright future," ITU News, October 5, 2018, https://news.itu.int/broadband-internet-connects-rural-communities-rwan....
- 21 Julius Bizimungu, "Rwandan schools to benefit as One Web launches broadband satellite today," The New Times, February 27, 2019, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/rwandan-schools-benefit-one-web-launche...; Dan Ngabonziza, "Rwanda Given 10-Year Grace Period on One Web Satellite Deal," KT Press, February 28, 2019, https://ktpress.rw/2019/02/rwanda-given-10-year-grace-period-from-one-w....
- <u>22</u> Daniel Sabiiti, "OneWeb Bankruptcy Relief motion won't affect Rwanda", KT Press, April 4, 2020, https://www.ktpress.rw/2020/04/oneweb-bankruptcy-relief-motion-wont-aff...
- 23 Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority, "Law No. 44/2001 of 30/11/2001 Governing Telecommunications, Chapter XIV. Rights of the Republic in Issues of Integrity," http://www.rura.rw/fileadmin/laws/TelecomLaw.pdf.
- 24 RINEX, "About Us," http://www.rinex.org.rw/about.html.
- 25 Rwanda Internet Communications & Technology Association, ".RW a name, your identity," https://ricta.org.rw/index.php.
- <u>26</u> Kieron Osmotherly, "MTN announces sale of mobile network towers to IHS in Rwanda and Zambia" TowerExchange, Februray 20, 2014, https://www.towerxchange.com/mtn-announces-sale-of-mobile-network-tower...
- 27 FMO Entrepreneurial Development Bank, "IHS Limited LTD," https://www.fmo.nl/project-detail/42316.
- 28 Interview with a Rwandan activist, March 2, 2020.
- <u>29</u> Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority, "Statistics Report for Telecom, Media and Broadcasting Sector as the Fouth Quarter of the Year 2019," https://rura.rw/fileadmin/Documents/ICT/statistics/Report for ICT Telec...
- <u>30</u> Interview conducted by consultant in 2019.
- 31 "Law N.09/2013 of 01/03/2013 Establishing Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority (RURA) and Determining its Mission, Powers, Organization and Functioning," Official Gazette n.14bis of 08/04/2013, August 4, 2013, http://www.rura.rw/fileadmin/laws/Official Gazette no 14 bis of 08 04 2....
- <u>32</u> Edwin Ashimwe, The New Times, December 15, 2020. https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/cabinet-names-new-parastatal-heads
- <u>33</u> Athan Tashobya, "President Kagame appoints more leaders," The New Times, September 3, 2017, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/219189.
- <u>34</u> Broadband Commission for Sustainable Development, "Mr. Patrick Nyirishema," <u>https://www.broadbandcommission.org/commissioners/Pages/Nyirishema.aspx</u>.
- <u>36</u> "2017 review: Airtel takeover of Tigo Rwanda operations jolted telecom sector," The New Times, January 9, 2018, http://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/227179.
- <u>37</u> "Law N°09/2013 OF 01/03/2013 Establishing Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority (RURA)," Official Gazette n°14bis of 08/04/2013, August 4, 2013, https://rura.rw/fileadmin/docs/report/Official Gazette no 14 bis of 08
- 38 Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority (RURA) was initially created by the Law n° 39/2001 of 13 September 2001 with the mission to regulate certain public utilities, namely: telecommunications network and/or telecommunications services, electricity, water, removal of waste products from residential or business premises, extraction and distribution of gas and transport of goods and persons. This Law was further reviewed and replaced by Law N° 09/2013 of 01/03/2013, https://rura.rw/index.php?id=44.
- 39 Republic of Rwanda Parliament-Senate, "PRESS RELEASE: Senate to conduct a campaign on its Genocide denial research findings," https://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php? id=32&tx news pi1%5Bnews%5D=204...; Republic of Rwanda Parliment-Senate, "The Structure of Genocide Denial and Demonstration Tutsis in Foreign Countries and Strategies Against It, 2019, https://www.parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/important_documents....
- 40 Interview conducted by Freedom House consultant in May 2021.
- 41 Interview conducted by consultant in 2019.

- 42 Dan McDevitt, "New Report Investigates Internet Censorship During Rwanda's 2017
 Presidential Election," Open Technology Fund, October 3, 2017,
 https://www.opentech.fund/news/new-report-investigates-internet-censors...
- 43 Ivan R. Mugisha, "Rwanda says Uganda agrees to unblock news sites," The East Africa, August 23, 2019, https://www.theeastafrican.co.ke/tea/news/east-africa/rwanda-says-ugand...;
 Jerry Chifamba, "East Africa: Two Days After Burying Hatchet, Rwanda and Uganda at it Again," August 23, 2019, https://allafrica.com/stories/201908230735.html; James Opio, "Rwanda blocks all Ugandan Newspapers deemed pro Museveni, TrumpetNews, August 23, 2019, https://trumpetnews.co.ug/rwanda-blocks-all-ugandan-websites-deemed-pro...
- 44 Interview conducted by Freedom House consultant in May 2021.
- 45 Interview with journalist writers of Igihe and Kigali Today.
- <u>46</u> Emmanuel Ntirenganya, "Govt moves to regulate social media content amid misinformation," The New Times, May 12, 2019 https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/govt-moves-regulate-social-media-conten...
- <u>47</u> "Law No. 18/2010 of 12/05/2010, Relating to Electronic Messages, Electronic Signatures and Electronic Transactions," Wipo IP Portal, http://www.wipo.int/wipolex/en/text.jsp? file id=243157.
- <u>48</u> Kara Fox, "Opposition members keep going 'missing' in Rwanda. Few expect them to return," CNN, July 27, 2019, https://www.cnn.com/2019/07/27/africa/rwanda-opposition-disappearances-...
- 49 Katrin Matthaei, "Rwanda: Censorship or self-censorship?" Deutsche Welle, December 9, 2014, https://www.dw.com/en/rwanda-censorship-or-self-censorship/a-18118956.
- <u>50</u> Presidency Rwanda, @UrugwiroVillage, "President Kagame: You were told after you went to the internet, stole from America, South Africa, disciplined in France, kidnapped from afar, and there were far and away. The lower beam the bark will yield. The ones they call cheating, they are ridiculous." Twitter post, May 8, 2019, https://twitter.com/UrugwiroVillage/status/1126081137586200576.
- <u>51</u> Interview with a Rwandan editor, March 28th 2020.
- 52 Republic of Rwanda Parliament-Senate, "PRESS RELEASE: Senate to conduct a campaign on findings," its Genocide denial research January 1, 2020, https://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=32&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=204...; Republic of Rwanda Parliament-Senate, "The Structure of Genocide Denial and Demonstration Tutsis in Countries Strategies and Against 2019. https://www.parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/important_documents....
- 53 Interview with online journalist, February 24, 2016.
- <u>54</u> Interviews conducted by consultant, 2019.
- <u>55</u> "Rwanda's media self-regulator subjected to intimidation campaign," Reporters without Borders, November 7, 2014, https://rsf.org/en/news/rwandas-media-self-regulator-subjected-intimida...; Tom Rhodes, "Twitter war shines light on how Rwanda intimidates press," Committee to Protect Journalists, March 24, 2014, https://cpj.org/x/59d6.
- <u>56</u> Rwanda: Arrests, Prosecutions over YouTube Posts, Human Rights Watch, March 30, 2021, https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/30/rwanda-arrests-prosecutions-over-yo....
- 57 RPF National Executive Committee meeting, Kigali-Rwanda, April 30, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8Novi2E7jwQ
- <u>58</u> Tom Rhodes, "Advertising and censorship in East Africa's press," Pambazuka News, February 19, 2014, http://www.pambazuka.org/governance/advertising-and-censorship-east-afr....
- 59 Eddie Nsabimana, "Media self-regulatory body suspends YouTube registration," New Times, December 30, 2020, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/media-self-regulatory-body-suspends-you...; Edwin Ashimwe, "New media commission directive on YouTubers triggers mixed reactions," New Times, December 18, 2020, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/new-media-commission-directive-youtuber....
- 60 The Chronicles, @ChroniclesRW, "UPDATE: Rwanda Media Commission (RMC) begins registering YouTube channels in new crackdown on content deemed 'unprofessional'. Opening one requires Rwf 50,000 (\$52) and you must be a trained journalist. RMC fashions itself as media's self-regulatory body, but is funded by Gov't," December 16, 2020, https://twitter.com/ChroniclesRW/status/1339242344198123526.
- 61 "Rwanda: Arrests, Prosecutions over YouTube Posts," Human Rights Watch, March 30, 2021, https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/30/rwanda-arrests-prosecutions-over-yo....
- 62 RMC, @RMC_Rwanda, "Statement addressed to all journalists during the covid-19 pandemic," April 13, 2020, Twitter post,

- 63 Interview with an editor, May 9, 2020.
- <u>64</u> Author interviews with anonymous journalists.
- 65 Naz Karim et al., "Lessons Learned from Rwanda: Innovative Strategies for Prevention and Containment of COVID-19," Annals of Global Health, 87(1), 23, https://www.annalsofglobalhealth.org/articles/10.5334/aogh.3172/#; "Rwanda Journalists trained to tackle Misinformation on COVID-19 pandemic," Internews, June 25, 2020, https://internews.org/news/rwanda-journalists-trained-tackle-misinforma....
- 66 RwandaTV, "'Ndi Umunyarwanda' in the eyes of social media enthusiasts," YouTube, April 26, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7q5tx]-9tFc; Daniel Sabiiti, "Family is Basis of Building 'Ndi Umunyarwanda' Identity- First Lady Jeannette Kagame," KT Press, November 1, 2020, https://www.ktpress.rw/2020/11/family-is-basis-of-building-ndi-umunyarw...; #NdiUmunyaRwanda, Twitter, accessed August 19, 2021, https://twitter.com/hashtag/NdiUmunyaRwanda?src=hashtag_click.
- <u>67</u> The Rwandan Constitution, Chapter IV-Human Rights and Freedoms, Article 38, p.15, <u>https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Rwanda_2015.pdf?lang=en</u>
- 68 @PrimatureRwanda, "Announcement on Enhanced COVID-19 Prevention Measures," March 21, 2020, Twitter, https://twitter.com/PrimatureRwanda/status/1241412264193937412/photo/1
- 69 @PrimatureRwanda, "Announcement on Enhanced COVID-19 Prevention Measures,"
 February 2, 2021, Twitter,
 https://twitter.com/PrimatureRwanda/status/1356668330384515076/photo/1;
 @PrimatureRwanda, "Statement on Cabinet Resolutions of 15/03/2021," Twitter, March 15, 2021, https://twitter.com/primaturerwanda/status/1371558629409705988.
- 70 Rwanda Media Counsel, @rmc_Rwanda, "Itangazo rigenewe Abanyamakuru muri ibi bihe bya Covid-19.." April 13, 2020, https://twitter.com/RMC Rwanda/status/1249730987703009280/photo/1
- 71 Kelly Rwamapera, Rwanda's Supreme Court decriminalizes cartooning, except for president," The Independent, April 25, 2019 https://www.independent.co.ug/rwandas-supreme-court-decriminalizes-cart...; Clement Uwiringiyimana, "Rwanda court repeals law banning satirical cartoons," Reuters, April 24, 2019 https://www.reuters.com/article/us-rwanda-politics-cartoons/rwanda-cour...
- <u>72</u> "Article 39, Law on prevention and punishment of cyber crimes," Official Gazette n. Special of 25/09/2018, September 25, 2018, https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php? id=2&no cache=1&tx drblob pi1%5B....
- <u>73</u> "Article 41: Creation or publication of a site for terrorist groups," 127-128, Official Gazette n. Special of 25/09/2018, accessed October 9, 2019, http://minijust.gov.rw/fileadmin/Laws and Regulations/Law on Cyber crim...
- 74 Interview with FH consultant.
- <u>75</u> "Article 236: Insults or defamation against the President of the Republic," Official Gazette no. Special of 27/09/2018, accessed October 9, 2019 http://www.therwandan.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/The-New-Rwanda-Pen...,
- <u>76</u> "Article 233: Humiliation of national authorities and persons in charge of public service,"
 Official Gazette no. Special of 27/09/2018, September 27, 2018,
 http://www.therwandan.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/The-New-Rwanda-Pen...; Abdi Latif
 Dahir, "Rwanda's new penal code bans cartoons that 'humiliate' public officials," Quartz Africa,
 October 2, 2018, https://qz.com/africa/1410418/rwanda-bans-cartoons-that-humiliate-gover...
- 77 "Article 194: Spreading false information or harmful propaganda with intent to cause a
 hostile international opinion against Rwandan Government," 177, Official Gazette no. Special
 of 27/09/2018, Septmeber 27, 2018, http://www.therwandan.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/The-New-Rwanda-Pen....
- <u>78</u> Jimmy Mafamvula Nkele, "Rwanda Enacts New ICT Regulations," JuriAfrique, December 30, 2016, http://juriafrique.com/eng/2016/12/30/rwanda-enacts-new-ict-regulations/.
- 79 "Articles 60: Improper use of public electronic communication network," Official Gazette n°26 of 27/06/2016, June 27, 2016, http://www.rura.rw/fileadmin/docs/Law_governing_Information_and_Communi....
- <u>80</u> "Law No. 18/2008 of 23/07/2008 Relating to the Punishment of the Crime of Genocide Ideology," Droit-Afrique, July 23, 2008, http://droit-afrique.com/upload/doc/rwanda/Rwanda-Loi-2008-18-repressio...
- <u>81</u> @RIB_rw, "Uyu munsi, RIB yafunze Karasira Aimable imukurikiranyeho icyaha cyo guhakana no guha ishingiro jenoside yakorewe abatutsi muri 1994 n'icyaha cyo gukurura amacakubiri.,"

- <u>82</u> Daniel Sabiiti, "Court Remands Karasira for 30 More Days," KT Press, July 27, 2021, <u>https://www.ktpress.rw/2021/07/court-remands-karasira-for-30-more-days/.</u>
- <u>83</u> "Journalist Detained for Refusing to Delete Recording of Court Session" Chronicles.rw, March 9, 2021, https://www.chronicles.rw/2021/03/09/journalist-goes-to-jail-for-refusi....
- <u>84</u> Edmund Kagire, "Youtube 'Activist' Idamange Faces 6 Charges As Prosecutors Make Case," KT Press, March 4, 2021, https://www.ktpress.rw/2021/03/youtube-activist-idamange-faces-6-charge...
- <u>85</u> Lavie Mutanganshuro, "Yvonne Idamange remanded for 30 days," New Times, March 9, 2021, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/yvonne-idamange-remanded-30-days.
- <u>86</u> "Rwanda: Arrests, prosecution over YouTube posts," Human Rights Watch, March 30, 2021, https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/30/rwanda-arrests-prosecutions-over-yo....
- <u>87</u> "Covid-19: Man arrested for publishing rumours," New Times, July 13, 2020, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/covid-19-man-arrested-publishing-rumours.
- <u>88</u> Edmund Kagire, "RMC, RURA Caution Journalists On Violating COVID-19 measures," KT Press, April 13, 2020, https://www.ktpress.rw/2020/04/rmc-rura-caution-journalists-on-violatin...; Interview with Rwandan lawyer in July 2020.
- 89 "Rwandan journalist Dieudonné Niyonsenga acquitted, released after 11 months in prison",
 Committee to Protect Journalists, March 15, 2021, https://cpj.org/2021/03/rwandan-journalist-dieudonne-niyonsenga-acquitt....; Rwandan journalist, media worker detained since mid-April, Committee to Protect Journalists,
 May 21, 2020, https://cpj.org/2020/05/rwandan-journalist-media-worker-detained-since-...
- 90 "Rwanda: Arrests, Prosecutions over YouTube Posts," Human Rights Watch, March 30, 2021, https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/30/rwanda-arrests-prosecutions-over-yo....
- <u>91</u> Habimana James, "Umunyamukuru Olivier Habimana yatawe muri yombi [Journalist Onliver Habimana was Arrested,]" Igihe, March 26, 2019, http://igihe.com/amakuru/u-rwanda/article/umunyamakuru-olivier-habimana....
- <u>92</u> Committee to Protect Journalists, "Shadrack Niyonsenga" <u>https://cpj.org/data/people/shadrack-niyonsenga/</u>.
- <u>93</u> "Rwandan YouTubers' trial postponed," APA News, June 14, 2021, http://apanews.net/en/pays/rwanda/news/rwandan-youtubers-trial-postponed.
- <u>94</u> Interview with Rwandan lawyer on March 30, 2020.
- <u>95</u> "Rwandan police arrest Paul Kagame critic Diane Rwigara," Aljazeera, September 24, 2017, <u>https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2017/09/rwandan-police-detain-paul-kagam...</u>.
- <u>96</u> Philbert Girinema and Katherine Houreld, "Rwanda disqualifies only female presidential candidate," Reuters, July 7, 2017, https://www.reuters.com/article/us-rwanda-election/rwanda-disqualifies-...
- 97 Kara Fox and Edward Keirnan, "She wanted to be president, but ended up jailed instead," CNN, August, 28, 2018, https://edition.cnn.com/2018/08/28/africa/hfr-rwanda-diane-rwigara-aseq....
- 98 Ivan R. Mugisha, "Kigali court orders Diane Rwigara and mother detained," The East African, October 23, 2017, https://www.theeastafrican.co.ke/news/No-bail-for-Rwanda-government-cri...
- 99 Tweet from Rep. Barbara Lee, @RepBarbaraLee, "In Rwanda, Diana Rigwara and her mother Adeline are being prosecuted for having the courage to speak up against corruption and autocracy," Twitter post, November 26, 2018, https://twitter.com/RepBarbaraLee/status/1067195799132459009; "#FreeDianeRwigara" twitter hashtag search, https://twitter.com/hashtag/FreeDianeRwigara?src=hash.
- 100 "Rwanda Flags Off SIM Card Registration Exercise," Chimp Reports, February 4, 2013, https://chimpreports.com/8072-rwanda-flags-off-sim-card-registration-ex....
- 101 Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Agency, "Regulations on SIM Card Registration," January 16, 2013, http://www.rura.rw/fileadmin/docs/Board_Decisions/FINAL_SIM_CARD_REGIST....
- 102 Magnus Mazimpaka, "Deadline: 24 Hours Left To SIM Card Registration, Here Is How To Do It," Taarifa, January 29, 2019, https://taarifa.rw/deadline-24-hours-left-for-sim-card-registration-her...; Collins Mwai, "Rwanda: RURA Clarifies New Simcard Regulations," AllAfrica, January 21, 2019, https://allafrica.com/stories/201901210058.html.
- 103 Fred K. Nkusi, "New ICT law embodies data privacy protection," The New Times, January 13, 2017, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/207958.

- <u>104</u> Hudson Kuteesa, "Sim card fraud: Telecoms to roll out biometric tech," The New Times, July 24, 2019, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/sim-card-fraud-telecoms-roll-out-biomet....
- 105 "Rwanda: Repression Across Borders," Human Rights Watch, January 28, 2014, https://www.hrw.org/news/2014/01/28/rwanda-repression-across-borders; Michela Wrong, "Suspects in murder of ex-Rwandan spy chief 'directly linked to Kigali' inquest", The Guardian, April 18, 2019, https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/apr/18/south-africa-interfered-i....
- <u>106</u> "Pegasus Project: Rwandan authorities chose thousands of activists, journalists and politicians to target with NSO spyware," Amnesty International, July 19, 2021, https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/press-release/2021/07/rwandan-authori...
- 107 Stephanie Kirchgaessner, Paul Lewis, David Pegg,Sam Cutler,Nina Lakhani and Michael Safi, "Revealed: leak uncovers global abuse of cyber-surveillance weapon," The Guardian, July 18, 2021, https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jul/18/revealed-leak-uncovers-gl...; "Response from NSO and governments," The Guardian, July 20, 2021, https://www.theguardian.com/news/2021/jul/18/response-from-nso-and-gove....
- 108 Mehul Srivastava and Tom Wilson, "Inside the WhatsApp hack: how an Israeli technology was used to spy," Financial Times, October 29, 2019, https://www.ft.com/content/d9127eae-f99d-11e9-98fd-4d6c20050229.
- 109 Bill Marczak, John Scott-Railton, Sarah McKune, Bahr Abdul Razzak, and Ron Deibert, "Hide and Seek: Tracking NSO Group's Pegasus Spyware to Operations in 45 Countries," The Citizen Lab, September 18, 2018, https://citizenlab.ca/2018/09/hide-and-seek-tracking-nso-groups-pegasus....
- <u>110</u> Financial Times, "Inside the WhatsApp hack: how an Israel technology was used to spy", <u>https://www.ft.com/content/d9127eae-f99d-11e9-98fd-4d6c20050229</u>; Nate Schenkkan and Isabel Linzer, "Rwanda: Transnational Repression Case Study," Freedom House, February 2021, <u>https://freedomhouse.org/report/transnational-repression/rwanda</u>.
- 111 Stephanie Kirchgaessner and Jason Burke, "Rwandan dissidents suspect Paul Rusesabagina was under surveillance," September 3, 2020, https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/sep/03/rwanda-dissidents-suspect...; Ignatius Ssuuna, ""Hotel Rwanda' hero arrested on terror charges, say police," Washington Post, August 31, 2020, https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/africa/hotel-rwanda-hero-arrested-....
- 112 "Israeli Spy Tech Used Against Daughter of Man Who Inspired 'Hotel Rwanda," OCCRP, July 19, 2021, https://www.occrp.org/en/the-pegasus-project/israeli-spy-tech-used-agai....
- <u>113</u> Eugene Kwibuka, "How the new law on criminal procedure will boost graft fight," The New Times, January 9, 2018, http://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/criminal-law-graft-fight.
- 114 Nasra Bishumba, "New penal code to sanction institution for genocide crime," The New Times, October 7, 2018, https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/new-penal-code-sanction-institutions-ge.... Lynsey Chuttel & Abdi Latif Dahir, "Rwanda opposition figure killed in South Africa", The New York Times, February 22, 2021, https://www.nytimes.com/2021/02/22/world/africa/rwanda-seif-bamporiki-k...
- 115 "Law Relating to the Interception of Communications, Article 6: Persons authorized to apply for an interception warrant," Official Gazette no 41 of 14/10/2013, November 14, 2013, https://perma.cc/LU73-ZC29
- <u>116</u> "Law Relating to the Interception of Communications, Article 12: Inspection," Official Gazette n° 41 of 14/10/2013, November 14, 2013, https://perma.cc/LU73-ZC29.
- <u>117</u> CIPESA, "State of Internet Freedom in Rwanda 2014," May 2014, http://www.cipesa.org/?wpfb_dl=179.
- <u>118</u> WikiLeaks, "Hacking Team," July 8, 2015, https://wikileaks.org/hackingteam/emails/emailid/449906.
- <u>120</u> "Rwanda: Draft data protection bill must incorporate freedom of expression and information safeguards," ARTICLE 19, June 15, 2021, https://www.article19.org/resources/rwanda-data-protection-bill-must-in...
- 121 "Law Relating to the Interception of Communications, Article 7: Requirement for a communication service provider," Official Gazette n° 41 of 14/10/2013, November 14, 2013, https://perma.cc/LU73-ZC29.

- 122 Interview with a staff member of a major telecommunications company active in Rwanda, February 2015.
- <u>123</u> Rwanda: Repression Across Borders," Human Rights Watch, January 28, 2014, https://www.hrw.org/news/2014/01/28/rwanda-repression-across-borders#
- 124 "Etienne Gatanazi,Aimable Karasira na Eric Bagiruwusa bashinjwe icyaha gikomeye cyane mu rwanda cyo [etienne gatanazi, karasira aimable, and eric bagiruwusa accused of the greatest crime in rwanda]," Azma TV, February 6, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7KKGb3hCdly.
- 125 "As Controversial As YouTube Has Become in Rwanda, It Is a Cash Cow For Many," Chronicles, March 5, 2021, https://www.chronicles.rw/2021/03/05/as-controversial-as-youtube-has-be...
- <u>126</u> Jean d'Amour Mbonyinshuti, "University sacks outspoken lecturer," August 21, 2020, https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20200821110239971.
- 127 "Rwanda: Arrests, prosecution over YouTube posts," Human Rights Watch, March 30, 2021, https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/30/rwanda-arrests-prosecutions-over-yo....
- 128 Abu-Bakarr Jalloh, "Rwanda gospel singer Kizito Mihigo's death likely a 'political assassination'" Deutsche Welle February 21, 2020, https://www.dw.com/en/rwanda-gospel-singer-kizito-mihigos-death-likely-...; "Rwanda: Ensure Justice Over Kizito Mihigo Death," Human Rights Watch, February, 20, 2020, https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/02/20/rwanda-ensure-justice-over-kizito-m....
- 129 "Rwanda musician Kizito Mihigo admits opposition RNC contract," BBC, November 7, 2014, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-29951677; "Rwanda: Ensure Justice Over Kizito Mihigo Death," Human Rights Watch, February 20, 2020, https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/02/20/rwanda-ensure-justice-over-kizito-m...; Lindsey Hilsum, "Rwandan singer's death in custody prompts calls for inquiry" Channel 4, February 21, 2020, https://www.channel4.com/news/rwandan-singers-death-in-custody-prompts-...
- 130 Republic of Rwanda Parliament-Senate, "PRESS RELEASE: Senate to conduct a campaign on its Genocide denial research findings," January 1, 2020, https://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=32&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=204...; Republic of Rwanda Parliament-Senate, "The Structure of Genocide Denial and Demonstation Tutsis in Foreign Countries and Strategies Against It," 2019, https://www.parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/important_documents....
- <u>131</u> HRW, "Rwanda: Events of 2019," <u>https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2020/country-chapters/rwanda</u>
- 132 "Rwandan journalist, media worker detained," Committee to Protect Journalists, May 21, 2020, https://cpj.org/2020/05/rwandan-journalist-media-worker-detained-since-...; Amensty International, "Rwanda: Submission to the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights," November
 2017, https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/AFR4761432017ENGLISH.PDF.
- <u>133</u> "Government Data Center Goes Down, President's Website Off," Taarifa, February 18, 2020, https://taarifa.rw/government-data-center-goes-down-presidents-website-...; Alex Alley, "Rwandan Government data center offline after cyber attack," February 27, 2020, https://www.datacenterdynamics.com/en/news/rwandan-government-data-cent....

ecoi.net summary:
Report on digital media
and internet freedom
(reporting period June 2020 May 2021)

Country: Rwanda

Source: Freedom House

Original link: https://freedomhouse.org/country/rwanda/freedom-net/2021

Document type: Periodical Report

Language: English

Published:

21 September 2021

Document ID: 2060931

Austrian Red Cross

Austrian Centre for Country of Origin and Asylum Research and Documentation (ACCORD) Wiedner Hauptstraße 32, 1041 Wien T (Telefon) +43 1 589 00 583 F (Fax) +43 1 589 00 589 info@ecoi.net

Contact
Imprint & Disclaimer
F.A.Q.
Data Protection Notice

ecoi.net is run by the Austrian Red Cross (department ACCORD) in cooperation with Informationsverbund Asyl & Migration. ecoi.net is funded by the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund, the Austrian Ministry of the Interior and Caritas Austria. ecoi.net is supported by ECRE & UNHCR.









